Literati Chan at the Song Dynasty Court:  
The Role of Yang Yi in the Creation Chan Identity  

Albert Welter  
Professor, Department of East Asian Studies, University of Arizona  

Abstract  
In The current study argues for the early Song Dynasty literatus Yang Yi’s 杨億 (974–1020) important role in the formation of Chan and the creation of Chan’s hallmark identity as “a separate transmission outside the teaching” (jiaowai biechuan 教外別傳). It is an amplification of my argument in Monks, Rulers, and Literati: The Political Ascendancy of Chan Buddhism based on close textual analysis and full translations of relevant documents: Preface to the Anthology of the Shared Practices of Buddhas and Patriarchs 佛祖同參集序; Preface to the Record of the Transmission of the Lamp compiled in the Jingde era 景德傳燈錄序; and entry on Yang Yi in the Expanded Lamp Record compiled in the Tiansheng era 天聖廣燈錄. Moreover, Yang Yi’s advocacy of Chan as “a separate practice outside the teaching” in the Chuandeng lu coincided with a literary model that distinguished Song civilization from its predecessors. Thus, his promotion of Chan was intermingled with political interests at the Song court, where Song officials sympathetic to Buddhism were concerned over ways to promote the religion that coincided with imperial motives. Yang Yi’s Jingde Chuandeng lu Preface specifies Chan as an imperially sanctioned form of Buddhism in the Song, explicitly mentioning the Song emperors’ important role in encouraging Chan.  

Keywords:  
Yang Yi, Chan, Jingde Chuandeng lu, separate transmission
宋朝朝廷的文人禪：
楊億在禪宗的獨特性之開創中所扮演的重要角色

魏雅博
美國亞利桑那州大學東亞研究學系教授

摘要

此研究探討宋朝初期的文人楊億（974–1020）在禪宗的形成和其創立標誌性的「教外別傳」中所扮演的重要角色。此文對〈佛祖同參集序〉、〈景德傳燈錄序〉以及〈天聖廣燈錄〉中一節與楊億有關的文獻，提供嚴謹的文本分析和完整的翻譯，這是根據我的書《和尚、統治者與文人：禪宗的政治優勢》（Monks, Rulers, and Literati: The Political Ascendancy of Chan Buddhism）中的觀點而更加詳盡的論證。此外，在《傳燈錄》中楊億所主張的禪宗之「教外別傳」的特性，剛好符合一種區分宋朝文化與先前朝代的文學模式。因此，他提倡推廣禪宗是和宋朝廷的政治興趣互相交織一起，宋朝官員支持佛教，而他們所關切的是在推廣宗教的方法和朝廷的主旨互相一致。楊億的〈景德傳燈錄序〉中具體說明禪宗是宋皇朝所認可的佛教型式，且明確地提到宋朝皇帝在護持禪宗中所扮演的重要角色。

關鍵詞：
楊億、禪宗、景德傳燈錄、別傳
The Importance of the Jingde Chuandeng lu and Yang Yi

The importance of the Jingde Chuandeng lu 景德傳燈錄 cannot be overstated. If asked to name the most influential text in the histories of the Chan, Sŏn, and Zen traditions, I would name the Jingde Chuandeng lu. Its influence stands greater than classic works like the Platform Sutra of the Sixth Patriarch 六祖壇經 and Record of Linji 臨濟語錄. This may be a surprising claim to many modern readers, to whom the Jingde Chuandeng lu may be less familiar. The Jingde Chuandeng lu is the first Chan text to be entered into the Chinese Buddhist canon. It is the first Chan text compiled with imperial approval, and as such, marked the new status that Chan had acquired in the Song Dynasty regime. The Jingde Chuandeng lu, in effect, identified Chan as the form of Buddhism sanctioned by the Song emperor and his emissaries, and brought all the regional Buddhist movements operating under the Chan banner that had prospered in the wake of a declining central authority after the rebellion of An Lushan into an ordered pattern, mirroring the success of the Song in reuniting the politically independent regions that China had devolved into.

Not only did the Jingde Chuandeng lu bring the disparate Chan factions into harmonious accord, it also spawned new dimensions of a spiritual tradition that became the hallmarks of Chan identity. The Jingde Chuandeng lu became the prototype of Chan denglu, or transmission records, the unique literary form that detailed the factional progressions from masters to disciples, the vaunted “mind-to-mind transmission” (yixin chuanxin 以心傳心) that distinguished Chan from other Buddhist traditions. Following the model that the Jingde Chuandeng lu set forth, five Chan transmission records were compiled throughout the Song dynasty, culminating in the Wudeng huiyuan 五燈會元 (Compendium of the Five Lamps), the defining records of the Chan experience. In addition, and perhaps more importantly, the Jingde Chuandeng lu generated

---

1 This paper is an amplification of arguments I first put forth in Welter, Monks, Rulers, and Literati. In addition to adding corrections and new elements, I also provide an Appendix with translations of the documents central to the argument put forth: Preface to the Anthology of the Shared Practices of Buddhas and Patriarchs 佛祖同參集序; Preface to the Record of the Transmission of the Lamp compiled in the Jingde era 景德傳燈錄序; Entry on Yang Yi in the Expanded Lamp Record compiled in the Tiansheng era 天聖廣燈錄序. I am indebted to the two anonymous reviewers for their suggestions on improvements, particularly regarding the translations. I also benefitted from comments offered by Mark Halperin, whose own interest in Yang Yi drew him into the orbit of the project. Any errors that remain, however, are mine alone.
other unique Chan literary forms, namely *yulu* (Dialogue Records) and *gong’an* (J. Kōan). While there are antecedents for these predating the *Jingde Chuandeng lu*, there is no denying the impact that the *Jingde Chuandeng lu* had on these forms.

In acknowledging the important role that the *Jingde Chuandeng lu* had for the development of Chan, one must also acknowledge the important role played by the official, Yang Yi (楊億), the subject of the current article, who served as editor-in-chief of the compilation. Under Yang Yi’s editorial supervision, the anthology compiled by the Fayan faction Chan monk Daoyuan (道原) as the *Fozu tongcan ji* (Anthology of the Shared Practices of Buddhas and Patriarchs) became the *Jingde Chuandeng lu*. In the *Jingde Chuandeng lu Preface*, Yang Yi presented Chan as a “a separate practice outside the teaching” (*jiaowai biexing* 教外別行), claiming this as Chan’s unique heritage, and one that distinguished it from other Buddhist schools, validated by Śākyamuni himself, the Way propagated by the true Dharma-eye. Yang Yi’s “separate practice” (*bie xing* 別行) later morphed into its more familiar form as a “separate transmission” (*bie chuan* 別傳), but there is no question that Yang Yi played an important role in Chan’s rebranding.

Yang Yi’s promotion of Chan was intermingled with political interests at the Song court. Song officials sympathetic to Buddhism were concerned over ways to promote the religion that coincided with imperial motives. Yang Yi’s *Jingde Chuandeng lu Preface* specifies Chan as an imperially sanctioned form of Buddhism in the Song, explicitly mentioning the important role played by

---

2 There is evidence that the phrase *jiaowai biechuan* was used earlier, in the *Zutang ji*, in the record of Shihuang Qingzhu (807–888; ZTJ, CBETA B25 144, 6:428b12–13) and in the *Zongjing lu* (T 2016, 41:660a5–6 & 660b2; T. Griffith Foulk, “Sung Controversies Concerning the ‘Separate Transmission’ of Ch’an,” 240–241), as well as appearing in Korean sources, in Yanguan Qi’an’s (鹽官齊安) Silla disciple Pomil (梵日) (810–889), (Jia Jinhua, *The Hongzhou School of Chan Buddhism*, 88). On the one hand, even though the early, 952 compilation date of the *Zutang ji* contents is questionable (see Kinugawa Kenji (衣川賢次), “Sodōshū ibun betsuji kōshō: Sodōshū chū no on’in shiryō” 「祖堂集」異文別字校證「祖堂集」中の音韻資料, as well as my summary in Welter, “Yulu Formation in Chinese Chan: The Records of Qingyuan Xingsi and Nanyue Huairang,” 82–84), it seems clear the use of the phrase *jiaowai biechuan* predates the *Jingde Chuandeng lu*. The point is not that Yang Yi and the *Jingde Chuandeng lu* represent the earliest usage but given Yang Yi’s stature at the Song court and the role that the *Jingde Chuandeng lu* played in defining Chan in the Song dynasty and beyond, there is no question that Yang Yi’s assertion was instrumental in establishing the Chan brand in these terms.
Song emperors in encouraging Chan. Who was this influential figure who did so much to further the Chan cause in official circles?

In addition to political reunification, one of the most noteworthy accomplishments of the early Song emperors was a reconstitution of China’s literary heritage, which had suffered greatly in the intervening decades of warfare and social disruption since the late Tang dynasty. One mark of this reconstitution was the compilation of four encyclopedic works, known collectively as the “four great collections” initiated during the reign of the second Song emperor, Taizong (r. 976–997). Three of these works, were completed under the editorial supervision of the “old guard” coterie of literati, led by the eminent figure, Li Fang 李昉 (d. 996):

- **Taiping yulan 太平御覽** (Imperial overview from the Taiping[xingguo] era), originally titled *Taiping zonglei 太平總類* (General topics of the Taiping reign), an encyclopedic work covering numerous topics that was personally read by the emperor.

- **Taiping guangji 太平廣記** (Extensive records of the Taiping[xingguo] era), an encyclopedic collection of supernatural events throughout ancient history.

- **Wenyuan yinghua 文苑英華** (Finest blossoms in the garden of literature), a massive collection of literary writings from the Liang period (502–557) to the tenth century.

With the passing of Wang Yucheng 王禹偁 (d. 1001), the old guard literary circle disappeared. Yang Yi was only 28 years old at the time and a Hanlin Academician. His reputation was great, and he became a leader among a new generation of literati. In 1005 Emperor Zhenzong (r. 997–1022) commissioned Yang Yi and other leading literati—Wang Qinruo 王欽若, Sun Shi 孫奭, Li Wei 李維, Qian Weiyin 錢惟演, Xia Song 夏竦, and others—fifteen people in all, to compile an encyclopedia on statecraft based on historiographical sources from ancient times on to the present. Drawing from the classics and histories, as well as older encyclopedias, the compilation team provided examples instructive for good rulership. It was given the title, *Cefu yuanguai 册府元龜* (Primary Models [literally referring to the “divination tortoise”] from the Storehouse of Literature) and became the fourth great work of the Song. This book was epoch-making. It made clear the difference between the features of Song and Tang civilization; it established firmly the “standard of good and bad,” and “exercised an inestimable influence upon the later system and learning of the Song,” specifically its influence over the compilation of
such works as the *Song huiyao* 宋會要 (Institutions of the Song) and the *Zizhi tongjian* 資治通鑑 (Comprehensive Mirror to Aid in Government).³

Emperor Zhenzong’s commission had an unintended consequence. Yang Yi had become associated with a new literary trend, referred to as Xikun Poetry. The term *Xikun* 西崑 refers to the place where the library of legendary emperors was located, and here it is used to allude to the imperial library of Song, where Yang Yi and his group did their work. Between 1005–1008, the same time Yang Yi and the editorial team were working on both the *Jingde Chuandeng lu* and the *Cefu yuangui*, they compiled a collection of Xikun Poetry, the *Xikun chouchang ji* 西崑酬唱集 (A Collection of Occasional and Exchange Poetry from the Xikun Group). Yang Yi was a major force behind each of these compilations, and while the precise relation between the three works as revelatory of Yang Yi’s perspective on *wen* 文 (literary culture) awaits further analysis, it is clear that they each, in their own way, hold the key.

While Yang Yi’s Xikun style poetry was highly praised at the time, his reputation as a poet did not endure. Ouyang Xiu 歐陽修 (1007–1072), the celebrated literatus of the next generation, commented how the style of poetry changed after publication of the *Xikun Collection*. The Xikun group composed poetry in an embellished and erudite style with many allusions, reminiscent of Li Shangyin 李商隱 (813–858), whom they took as their model.⁴ The use of

---


⁴ On the use of allusion in Li Shangyin’s poetry, see Teresa Yee-Wah Yu, “Li Shangyin: The Poetry of Allusion,” which includes (in Chapter IV) an interpretive study of six of Li Shangyin’s characteristically allusive poems. On the influence of Buddhist ideas on the construction of Yang Yi’s poetics, I have benefitted from the unpublished paper of Rongrong Fu, “Exploring Buddhism in the Poetry of Yang Yi.” In the *Songchao shishi leiyuan* 宋朝事實類苑 (Garden of the Miscellany of Facts pertaining to the Song Court), Yang Yi described how he came upon Li Shangyin’s poetry and began to recognize its value (thanks to Rongrong Fu for this reference).

During the *zhidao* period (995–997), I accidentally got hold of over a hundred of Yu Xisheng’s (i.e., Li Shangyin) poems. I liked them very much but did not yet understand their profound meaning. During the *xianping* (998–1003) and *jingde* (1004–1007) periods, as I spent my leisure developing my literary skills, I searched everywhere for collections of poems by famous gentlemen of previous generations. I recognized the richness exhibited in his able craftsmanship, combined with elegant beauty, wrapped in abstruse mystery, and smooth expression. The longer I partook of them, unable to exhaust them, the more outstanding they appeared. I studied them intensively and extensively
allusion is inherent in Yang Yi’s poetics, as the accompanying translations reveal, and make the task of translation commensurably difficult. Without comprehensive and detailed knowledge of the traditions that preceded Yang Yi and that Yang Yi drew from—historical, philosophical, literary, and poetic—it is easy to miss his point. To choose but one example, when Yang Yi refers to qiāngmian （"facing the wall"），it could be an allusion to Analects (Lunyu 論語) 17–10, where it refers pejoratively to someone who does not study, and therefore is ignorant, but in Yang Yi’s case, he is more likely inferring the foundational Chan story about the patriarch Bodhidharma sitting facing a wall during prolonged meditation, allegedly for nine years, and his devotion to the practice of zuōchān 坐禪 （seated meditation）. Without recourse to this background knowledge, it is easy to miss the intended meaning associated with the otherwise simple term qiāngmian.

What Yang Yi derived from Buddhism generally and Chan more specifically was a propensity to rely on mind and intuition, rather than the written word, to develop the consciousness of a buddha, “the wisdom of "awareness" to break through all obstacles and break down the barriers brought by transitional interpretation in order to understand the true nature of the universe.” Yang Yi’s poetics were thus highly influenced by Buddhism, and especially the Chan emphasis of “expressing the essence without focusing on the words.” In this way, Yang Yi’s study of Buddhism, his engagements with Chan monks and his editing of Chan texts, greatly influenced his poetics and represented a “paradigm shift” in the transformation of poetry from the Tang to Song dynasties. In her study on the influence of Buddhist ideas on the construction of Yang Yi’s poetics, Rongrong Fu concludes, “Buddhist concepts were accepted as theoretical references and practical experiences by official scholars, who then integrated them in their construction of the fresh and creative poetic paradigm that became characteristic of the Song Dynasty.”
A brief example of Yang Yi’s poetics in the *Xikun Collection*, including allusions to Buddhism, is seen in the following verses.

The door tightly closed during the five night watches, water rarely leaks in.
The sound of woven bamboo in the night ceases, jade ornament banners flutter.

At daybreak the stars filling the sky become invisible, one hears chickens awakening.
In the springtime in a drizzling rain, I return with a pheasant shot by arrow.

I step toward the golden lotus, the waves splash my stockings.
I sing of crossing over to the jeweled trees, tears dampen my robe.

Recumbent like a dragon, the auspicious aura of the emperor expires after three hundred [years].
Similar to cleansing waters swelling toward an open door.

五鼓端門漏滴稀。夜籠聲斷翠華飛。
繁星曉埭聞雞度。細雨春場射雉歸。

---

7 Five two-hour periods of the night in traditional Chinese timekeeping, from 7:00 pm to 5:00 am.
8 Jade ornament banners were used whenever the emperor travelled.
9 Xiyu 細雨 (Drizzling Rain) is the title of a poem by Li Shangyin.
10 Jin lian 金蓮 is an abbreviation of jin lianhua 金蓮華. The lotus symbol is one of the most prevalent in Buddhism, alluding to the quest to rise above the mire and darkness of the world (i.e., mud) that humans are embedded in, to seek the light, bloom and thrive, and attain enlightenment (i.e., flowering lotus). Different colors of the lotus flower represent different meanings. Gold is the symbol of complete and total enlightenment, representative of a buddha. Its appearance is ubiquitous throughout Buddhist, especially Mahayana literature, as in the title of the Lotus sutra (Miaofa lianhua jing 妙法蓮華經; T 262, 9).
11 Jeweled trees frequently appear in places where the conditions for attaining enlightenment are most evident, such as the Pure land. According to Phyllis Granoff, “Maitreya’s Jewelled World: Some Remarks on Gems and Visions in Buddhist Texts,” jewels and jeweled objects like trees often appear in Buddhist stories as karmic rewards for good behavior, such as in the Jeweled World of Maitreya experienced by Sudhana in the Gaṇḍavyūha Sūtra (Huayan jing 華嚴經; T 278, 9 & T 279, 10).
12 Describing the look of majestic repose.
步試金蓮波濺襪。歌翻玉樹涕沾衣。
龍盤王氣終三百。猶得澄瀾對敞扉。

These verses skillfully interweave aspirations for future enlightenment, symbolized by a golden lotus and jeweled trees, with the reality of misfortunes implicit in such aspirations, waves splashing his stocking and tears dampening his robe—contrasting the ideal visions of Buddhism with the sorrows of human experience. In a similar fashion, Yang Yi contrasts a successful regime, where no cracks in the door allow damages to leak in and imperial banners flutter as the emperor courses through his empire, and where the everyday occurrences of chickens awakening at dawn and folks returning from the pheasant hunt are unobstructed, with the energy of an empire depleted after many years, and “cleansing waters swelling toward an open door” —a foreboding of imperial demise and renewal. The use of the term *xiyu* 細雨 (Drizzling Rain), invokes the title of a poem by Yang Yi’s model, Li Shangyin.13

Although often overlooked, a recent assessment by Chinese literature scholar Yugen Wang suggests, “the rise to national prominence of the Xikun poets at the beginning of the eleventh century was the most important event that provided a necessary foundation for the rise of both the Ouyang Xiu generation in midcentury and the Jiangxi school of the late Northern Song.”14 Nonetheless, the Xikun style fell out of vogue quickly. At the end of the biographies of Yang Yi and Liu Yun 劉筠 in the 12th century *Dongdu shilüe* 東都事略, the compiler finds the need to promptly attach a note to say that, although both men were famous good men in their time, their writing strayed from ancient models.

---

13 Drizzling Rain (provisional translation):

A curtain (1) blown about in the wind at the White Jade Hall (2),
A bamboo mat rolled out, [the clear sky] like a bed of blue ivory.
[Like] the woman of Chu’s (3) thought at that time,
A feeling of isolation evoked a cool sensibility.

細雨：帷飄白玉堂，簟卷碧牙床。楚女當時意，蕭蕭發彩涼。
[Notes: (1) The curtain here refers to the drizzle falling from the sky, like a light curtain. (2) The White Jade Hall refers to the Heavenly Palace; according to legend when the mid-Tang dynasty poet Li He was about to die, he saw a heavenly messenger proclaim the emperor’s order to summon him to Heaven to write a commemorative note for the newly constructed White Jade Pavilion. (3) The woman of Chu likely refers to the goddess appearing in the *Songs of Chu* 楚辭 (*Jiuge* 九歌: *Shaosiming* 少司命); David Hawkes, trans., *The Songs of the South*, 111–112.]

It is ironic that posterity had little use for Yang's poetry but warmly embraced his view of Chan.

It is not only tempting, but necessary, to see the conjunction of Yang Yi’s interest in traditional historiography, Xikun poetry, and Linji Chan as instrumental to the formation of his literary imagination and the role of poetry in the formation of a unique Song literary aesthetic. In addition to being a leading literatus, it is well-known that Yang Yi was an influential Buddhist in the early Song Dynasty, with close connections to Linji Master Guanghui Yuanlian 廣慧元璉, disciple of Shoushan Xingnian 首山省念 (responsible for Linji faction ascendency in the Song), as well as Tiantai master Siming Zhili 四明知禮. 16 He had numerous contacts with Buddhist figures. These connections were instrumental in Yang Yi’s promotion of Chan as representative of a new, free-expression style of poetry in official circles in the Song dynasty.

With the passing of the Taizong (r. 976–997), who the Vinaya Master and literatus Zanning 贊寧 counted as a major patron, the Vinaya school (lüzong 律宗) fell out of favor. The third Song emperor, Zhenzong (r. 997–1022), preferred the school of emptiness (kongzong 空宗), in other words Chan, and it became the mainstream Buddhist faith in the capital. 17 This change of

---

15 I am indebted to Mark Halperin for this observation. The Dongdu shilüe 東都事略 (Eastern Capital Miscellany) is an alternate history of the Northern Song dynasty compiled by Wang Cheng 王稱, an official in the historiographic compilation bureau of the Southern Song, and issued in 1186. Yang Yi and Liu Yun’s biographical records are in fascicle 47, https://ctext.org/wiki.pl?if=gb&chapter=500043. Wang Cheng’s comment follows the record of Liu Yun: “Yi and Yun were both famous in the world for their wen. Nevertheless, they had strayed far from the ancients.” 億與筠皆以文名于世。然去古既遠遠。


17 Huang, “Imperial Rulership and Buddhism,” 166. It is also important to note that in spite of Yang Yi’s reputation, he was not always viewed favorably by Emperor Zhenzong. In the first year of jingde (1004), when Khitan horsemen of the Liao Dynasty invaded the empire from the north, the court ministers panicked and persuaded Emperor Zhenzong to retreat to the capital. Only Yang Yi and Kou Zhun 寇准 argued for armed resistance. Even though Zhenzong was reluctant to fight and signed the Chanyuan treaty in 1005 to avoid conflict, he never forgave those who urged him to risk his life in battle. Kou Zhun was slandered because of this and died in Leizhou after being demoted. Yang Yi was not demoted, but he also left a very bad impression on Zhenzong, who once expressed his dissatisfaction with Yang Yi to his prime minister, Wang Dan, saying, “Yi is by nature stern and impatient, and exaggerates excessively. No one can match him as a literary scholar.
perspective coincided with Yang Yi’s tenure as leading literatus at the Song court and his promotion of Chan as the preferred form of Buddhism in court circles. Although respectful of literati who “sought to make wen the vehicle for inculcating moral values,” Yang was an unabashed proponent of wen as an expression of literary refinement, rather than “archaic” or “classical” literature (guwen 古文), preferring prose that “traces emotional responses to embody things” (yuanqing tiwu 緣請體物) and “sings of the emotional nature” (yinyong qingxing 吟詠情性). It is difficult not to see Yang Yi’s promotion of Chan denglu and yulu as part of his search for a new expression of wen at the Song court.

Beyond the immediate impact that the Jingde Chuandeng lu set for Chan and Chan’s role in an imperially inspired imagination for a unique Song literary culture, the work also provided a template for the development of the denglu genre. Throughout the Song, five further denglu compilations followed in the Jingde Chuandeng lu’s wake:

- **Tiansheng Guang denglu** 天聖廣燈錄 (Tiansheng era Expanded Lamp Record, 1036)
- **Jianzhong jingguo xu denglu** 建中靖國續燈錄 (Jianzhong jingguo era Continued Lamp Record, 1101)
- **Zongmen Liandeng huiyao** 宗門聯燈會要 (Essential Materials of the Chan School’s Successive Lamp Records, 1183)
- **Jiatai pu denglu** 嘉泰普燈錄 (Jiatai era Comprehensive Lamp Record, 1204)
- **Wudeng Huiyuan** 五燈會元 (Compendium of the Five Lamps, 1252)

As a result, it is hard to overestimate the role the Jingde Chuandeng lu played in creating the tradition we have come to know today as Chan, Zen and Sŏn.

---

However, some say he is fond of undermining the imperial government?” (Zizhi tongjian 資治通鑑 83–27 https://ctext.org/wiki.pl?if=gb&chapter=258608; Fu, “Exploring Buddhism in the Poetry of Yang Yi”)

18 Bol, “This Culture of Ours,” 161.
19 On Buddhism and the wen revival, see my earlier study, “A Buddhist Response to the Confucian Revival: Tsan-ning and the Debate over Wen in the Early Sung.”
A Tale of Two Prefaces: Yang Yi’s “Conversion” from Fayan to Linji Faction Chan

Yang Yi wrote two prefaces to Daoyuan’s work, the first for the work as Daoyuan originally conceived it with the title *Fozu tongcan ji*, the second as revised under the editorial supervision of Yang Yi, conducted by imperial request, with the title *Jingde Chuandeng lu*. Daoyuan was a Fayan monk about whom almost nothing else is known. Our best window into Daoyuan’s understanding of Chan may be Yang Yi’s preface to the *Fozu tongcan ji*. The extent to which it may reflect Daoyuan’s original intent is the subject of speculation given the lack of supporting documentation, but as explained below, there is reason to assume that Yang Yi’s understanding of the *Fozu tongcan ji* was consistent with Daoyuan’s. One thing we know from Daoyuan’s original title is that he imagined a different conception for Chan as part of the common heritage of the Buddhist tradition than was eventually designated for the *Jingde Chuandeng lu*. This conception of Chan in harmony with Buddhist teaching was a legacy of the Wuyue-based Fayan faction, from which Daoyuan derived.\(^{20}\) The “Buddhas and Patriarchs” 佛祖 represent Buddhist and Chan teaching, respectively, while the “Shared Practices” 同参 signifies the harmony that exists between them. In this way, Daoyuan conceived his compilation after the fashion of Zongmi’s 宗密 interpretation of Chan in his *Chan Preface* 禪源諸詮集都序.

While this has been my functioning hypothesis,\(^{21}\) recently Randolph Whitfield, translator of the *Jingde Chuandeng lu*, has taken a different view. In Volume 5 of his translation of the *Jingde Chuandeng lu*, Whitfield includes a translation of Yang Yi’s preface to the *Fozu tongcan ji*,\(^{22}\) which he introduces as “afford[ing] an insight into the profound homogeneity of the two prefaces.” Whitfield’s presumption of “profound homogeneity” rests on mistaken readings of Yang Yi’s preface. Following here are my translation and punctuated text.\(^{23}\)

\(^{20}\) The character of Wuyue Chan is reflected in the thought of its leading representative, Yongming Yanshou (see Welter, *Yongming Yanshou’s Conception of Chan in the Zongjing lu*).

\(^{21}\) See *Monks, Rulers, and Literati*, especially 174–186, where I inadvertently labeled the *Fozu Tongcan ji* preface as Daoyuan’s instead of Yang Yi’s first preface.

\(^{22}\) Record of the Transmission of the Lamp, volume 5, 20–24.

\(^{23}\) Yang Yi’s *Fozu tongcan ji* Preface 佛祖同参集序 is found in the collected works of Yang Yi, the *Wuyi xinji* (Literary Collection of Yang Yi). My source is the punctuated version reproduced in Ishii Shūdō, *Sōdai zenshūshi no kenkyū*, 21a–
[Chan patriarchs] reveal expedient means according to individual encounters, applying them appropriately to different circumstances. [Sentient beings] are each following their own paths, resulting in fish traps and rabbit’s snares as means to ends to assist them. By analogy, all the texts of the three branches of the tripitaka were assembled together in Mahākāśyapā’s Pippala cave, and what was uttered by the Seven Buddhas was secretly kept in the palace of the nāga [king]; if the teachings of Chan patriarchs recorded here went unheard, how would future generations secure access to them!

In fairness, prefaces and postfaces written by literati scholars like Yang Yi are notoriously difficult, partaking freely of obscure terminology and distant allusions intended to stretch (and impress) the most literarily gifted. Without proper context (and in this case guidance from one of Japan’s most gifted Zen scholars, Ishii Shūdō), it is all too easy to be led astray. Proper punctuation, as well, can prove troublingly elusive. Whitfield erroneously included 仰 (“Looking up in admiration”) as the beginning of the next passage, when it properly belongs with the end of the last one. In addition to punctuation issues, Whitfield’s translation suffers from some regrettable misreadings.

23a (hereafter abbreviated as Ishii); the English translation was made in consultation with Ishii’s Japanese translation on p. 14.

24 Although it is possible to read this passage without inferring Chan patriarchs as the subject, as evident in the appended translation, it comes at the end of a depiction of how Chan teachings arrived in China, and as the preface for a collection of records of Chan masters, this more specific reference seems to be intended.

25 Reading 娑鶻 as a mistake for 娑竭, an abbreviation of 娑竭羅, a transliteration of the Sanskrit sāgara, meaning ocean, and referring to the nāga (dragon) king of the ocean palace. In Buddhist mythology, the palace of the nāga kings one of the eight oceans surrounding Mt. Sumeru, where the scriptures containing the teachings of the seven buddhas of the past were stored (see, for example, the Jinguangming jing zhaojie 金光明經照解 2, CBETA X 361, 20: 511a4–12). In Mahayana, the origin of Buddhist scriptures not recorded in the tripitaka assembled in Mahākāśyapā’s Pippala cave is explained as being sequestered in the nāga palace. I am indebted to Jhen-Hong Yang of the Chung-Hwa Institute of Buddhist Studies for this reference.

26 仰先是諸方大士各立宗徒互顯師承。”Looking up in admiration to all the great ones of yore, each one stands in the Chan lineage as disciple, appearing as masters
The most unfortunate is Whitfield’s failure to identify *guishan* 圭山 as referring to Guishan Zongmi 圭山宗密, *chanquan* 禪詮 with Zongmi’s *Chanyuan zhuquan ji* 禪源諸詮集, and *duxu* 都序 with his *Chanyuan zhuquan ji duxu* 禪源諸詮集都序. Coupled with repeated punctuation mistakes, Whitfield produces a translation with no bearing on the intended meaning. In place of vague meanderings on the meaning of Chan lineages, in my translation Yang Yi provides a precise reference to Chan’s varied lineage traditions.

Formerly there were great masters of various locales who established their own individual lineages of followers, revealing to each other transmission from master to master, and frequently preserved in recorded sayings. *Guishan* [Zongmi] 圭山宗密 was disturbed over this state of affairs. He assimilated the various [Chan] interpretations, compiling the *Chanyuan zhuquan ji*. He harmonized the various [Chan] houses to perfectly form a single flavor. The accomplishments of the patriarchs were completely accounted for. Through the passage of time, the full *Preface* alone remains; the one hundred fascicle text is no longer in circulation.27

As indicated here, Yang Yi conceived Daoyuan’s work as complementary to Zongmi’s *Chanyuan zhuquan ji* 禪源諸詮集. In Zongmi’s interpretation of Chan, one has to use the words of the Buddha to show the meaning and advantages of each faction, and thus to classify these teachings into three divisions corresponding to the three canonical teachings—the three doctrinal systems of Buddhist scholasticism, understood by Zongmi as Hinayana,

---

27 Whitfield’s punctuation and reading: 迭存語録圭山，患其如是也。會合衆說，著為禪詮。融通諸家，圓成一味。蓋祖門之能事畢矣。歷嵗彌久，都序僅存，百巻之文，不傳於世。” (p. 22)
Yogacārā, and Śūnyatāvāda. In Zongmi’s understanding, these doctrinal frames grounded and legitimized the various teachings of Chan factions.\(^{28}\) Regardless of how faithful the *Fozu tongcan ji* was to Zongmi’s precise application of Buddhist doctrine to classify Chan factions, Yang Yi clearly concurred with Zongmi in principle. Such agreement coincides with the influence of the Wuyue Chan heritage over Daoyuan, exhibited in the teachings attributed to Tiantai Deshao 天台德紹, and the writings of Yongming Yanshou 永明延壽 and Zanning.\(^{29}\) The Fayan Chan faction 法眼禪宗 teaching that dominated the region was indebted to Zongmi’s formulation of Chan as harmonious with Mahāyāna scriptural and doctrinal traditions.

**From Fozu tongcan ji to Jingde Chuandeng lu**

The aim for the *Fozu tongcan ji* as the “shared practices of buddhas and patriarchs” (佛祖同參)\(^{30}\) stands in marked contrast to Yang Yi’s purpose for the *Jingde Chuandeng lu*. According to Yang Yi, the record compiled by Daoyuan went beyond the ordinary recounting of interactions and dealings of individual masters associated with monk’s histories 僧史 (like the *Biographies of Eminent Monks* collections) and Zongmi’s *Chanyuan zhuquan ji* 禪詮 that have been collected elsewhere.\(^{31}\) As recounted by Yang Yi, it “revealed the miraculously brilliant true mind, and explained the profound principle of our predecessors regarding the emptiness of suffering” (開示妙明之真心。祖述苦空之深理。). By analogy, Yang Yi refers to being in tacit

\(^{28}\) Kamata Shigeo, *Zengen shosenshū tojo*, 49; Jan Yun-hua, “Tsung-mi, His Analysis of Ch’an Buddhism.” “If one does not use the words of the Buddha to show the meaning and advantages of each faction, and thus classify their teachings into three divisions corresponding to the three canonical teachings, then how could they be brought together to form a suitable substitute [for canonical teachings] and become an essential and marvelous gateway to the Dharma?” (若不以佛語各示其意各收其長。統為三宗對於三教。則何以會為一代善巧俱成要妙法門？). For an alternate rendering, see Jeffrey Broughton, *Zongmi on Chan*, 111–112.

\(^{29}\) I have discussed this elsewhere, especially in *Monks, Rulers, and Literati*.

\(^{30}\) The translation of 同參 as “shared practices” admittedly does not capture the nuances of the term well. *Can 参* has the meanings of “to take part in,” “to participate,” “to join,” “to attend”—indicating the more comprehensive attention to practice in this context as a member of the clergy under the direction of a Chan master.

\(^{31}\) CBETA T 2076, 51: 196c27–197a1. 若乃但述感應之徵符。専叙參遊之軌迹。此已標於僧史。亦奚取於禪詮。聊存世系之名。庶紀師承之自然而舊録所載。或掇粗而遺精。別集具存。
agreement with the transmission of the lamp (即何以契傳燈之喻). With this designation, Yang Yi marked the novel character of the work as not merely a “collection” or “anthology” of common or shared practices (or interactions) 同 參集, but as a Chuandeng lu 傳燈錄 (Record of the Transmission of the Lamp), “revealing the miraculously brilliant true mind” that distinguishes it from its more prosaic predecessors. It is important to acknowledge that the way this unique Chan literary genre came to be defined as chuandeng lu is the result of Yang Yi’s new designation, and that the designation, so famous in Chan, Sŏn, and Zen lore, was initiated by a secular official (albeit a faithful Chan patron), and not by a regular member of the Chan clergy. In the process, Yang Yi was not merely championing Chan as the new style of Buddhism for the Song establishment but celebrating its break from conventional Buddhist approaches.

In addition to identifying the chuandeng lu genre with Chan, Yang Yi also played a leading role in determining how Chan teaching came to be defined. Anyone with passing familiarity with Chan (or Zen) today will identify it according to its self-proclaimed status as “a separate transmission outside the teaching” 教外別傳. However famous the saying as a definitive Chan, Sŏn, and Zen indicator, virtually no one acknowledges the role played by Yang Yi in establishing Chan’s reputation in these terms. In his Preface to the Chuandeng lu, Yang Yi recounts how Śākyamuni, on the basis of having received the prediction of enlightenment from Dīpaṃkara Buddha, preached in the world for forty-nine years, initiating the approaches of the expedient and real, sudden and gradual, and spreading both partial and complete, lesser and greater vehicle teachings. He awakened people to principle in accordance with their capacities, resulting in the distinctiveness of the three vehicles. Before entered into extinction (i.e., nirvāṇa) between the twin [sala] trees, he transmitted the Dharma to Mahākāśyapa alone.

33 Note, however, that the Tiansheng Guangdeng lu 天聖廣燈錄 includes Yang Yi among the list of Chan transmission recipients.
34 The Chinese name for Dīpaṃkara, randeng 燃燈, literally means a burning lamp, an analogy for Chan transmission in the Jingde Chuandeng lu.
35 T 2076, 51: 196b15–20. 昔釋迦文。以受然燈之夙記當賢劫之次補。降神演化四十九年。開權實頓漸之門。垂半滿偏圓之教。隨機悟理。爰有三乘之差。接物利生。乃度無邊之衆。其悲濟廣大矣。其軌式備具矣。而雙林入滅。獨顧於飲光。
It persisted through mutual transmission [from master to master], down through the first [Chinese patriarch] Bodhidharma. [He taught] “do not establish words and letters, directly point to the source of the mind, do not engage in gradual methods, and attain Buddhahood at once.” After [Bodhidharma’s teaching] was transmitted through five generations (reaching Huineng), it began to flourish; dividing into a thousand lamps, it proliferated even further. Those who arrived at the jeweled site (i.e., attained awakening) increased greatly, and those who turned the wheel of the Dharma were not limited to a single person [Śākyamuni]. In other words, the point [of the teaching] transmitted by the great hero [Śākyamuni] and the Way propagated by the true [Dharma]-eye (i.e., the Patriarchs) is “a separate practice outside the teaching” beyond rational comprehension. 36
屈昭相傳，首從於達磨。不立文字，直指心源。不踐楷梯，徑登佛地。逮五葉而始盛，分千燈而益繁。達寶所者蓋多，轉法輪者非一。蓋大雄付囑之旨，正眼流通之道，教外別行，不可思议者也。

In the Jingde Chuandeng lu Preface, Yang Yi presented Chan as a “a separate practice outside the teaching” (教外別行), claiming this as Chan’s unique heritage and one that distinguished it from other Buddhist schools, validated by Śākyamuni himself, the Way propagated by the true Dharma-eye. This representation of Chan contrasts sharply with his statements in the Fozu tongcan ji Preface considered above. In the Fozu tongcan ji Preface, Yang Yi conceived Chan practice consistent with the way Chan was practiced in Wuyue, emphasizing myriad practices (wanxing 萬行) as means to instruct people toward the realization of nirvāṇa.

The only way of release from birth and death (i.e., saṃsāra) is to realize nirvāṇa; to instruct those who are confused, myriad practices (wanxing) are employed according to differences [among practitioners]. 38
至扵出離生死一門，證于涅槃。誘導愚迷，萬行以之差別。

By looking closely at the variant wording in the two prefaces we are afforded a glimpse at the new way Yang Yi reinterpreted Daoyuan’s compilation. In the Fozu tongcan ji Preface, Yang Yi characterized Chan as a

---

36 Ishii, 22b1–4; trans., 8–9; CBETA T 2076, 51: 196b.
37 Following Ishii, reading 鬱 for (日+旬).
38 Ishii, 22a10–11.
teaching where “myriad practices are employed according to the differences among practitioners” (萬行以之差別), an interpretation compatible with Wuyue style Chan. In the Jingde Chuandeng lu Preface, Yang Yi reinterpreted Daoyuan’s record in terms of “a separate practice outside the teaching” (教外別行). In the former, Yang Yi viewed Chan through the lens of wanxing 萬行, “myriad practices”; in the latter he viewed Chan through the lens of biexing 別行, a “separate practice” distinct from the “myriad practices” sanctioned by conventional Buddhist teaching. In this way, Yang Yi came to endorse the Linji faction Chan interpretation that promoted Chan exclusivity and implicitly undermined the pluralistic approach of Wuyue-based, Fayan faction Chan.

The two interpretations of Chan are also reflected in the slogans attributed to Bodhidharma in each preface. According to the Fozu tongcan ji Preface, “[Bodhidharma] did not make a display of verbal expressions (不事語言), and did not establish words and letters (不立文字).” 39 In the Jingde Chuandeng lu Preface shown above, Yang Yi attributed to Bodhidharma the teaching: “do not establish words and letters (不立文字), directly point to the source of the mind (直指心源), do not engage in gradual methods (不踐楷梯), and attain Buddhahood at once (徑登佛地).” The two prefaces agree that Bodhidharma’s teaching included “do not establish words and letters” (不立文字). They disagree, however, on how this phrase is to be interpreted, and their rival interpretations reflect their divergent views on the relationship between Chan and Buddhist practice.

Yang Yi and the Creation of Chan Identity

Yang Yi’s promotion of Chan was intermingled with political interests at the Song court. Song officials sympathetic to Buddhism were concerned over ways to promote the religion that coincided with imperial motives. Yang Yi’s Jingde Chuandeng lu Preface specifies Chan as an imperially sanctioned form of Buddhism in the Song, explicitly mentioning the important role played by Song emperors in encouraging Chan.

With the commencement of the Song dynasty, the human spirit has been quietly supported by sagely rulers. Emperor Taizu, after quelling the chaos thorough his spiritual might, showed respect for (i.e., supported) Buddhist monasteries and opened their gates for ordinations. Emperor Taizong, with imperial intelligence and rhetorical skill, explained the

39 Ishii, 22a7–8.
abstruse principles [of Buddhist teaching] and promoted ultimate truth. Your majesty [Emperor Zhenzong] furthers the will [of his predecessors] with his astute literary [sensibility]; by writing a preface for the *Teachings of the Sacred Ones*, he presented the teachings of our school (i.e., Buddhism). His hand-brushed calligraphy lights up [the heavens up through] the heaven of bodhisattvas who understand ultimate truth, and his golden voice shakes the garden of the enlightened. His words are in secret harmony with the lotus womb, and he successfully promotes the intentions [of the Buddha] from India. Those who plant myriad virtues steadily increase, and those who transmit a comprehensive understanding [of Buddhism] appear with great frequency. [As a result], the transformation brought about by perfect and sudden enlightenment as taught [in the Chan school] spreads throughout the districts and regions [of the land].

In linking Chan to imperial policy, Yang Yi stresses how the Song founder Taizu, after quelling chaos with his martial spirit, exalted the purity of Buddhist monasteries and encouraged monks to enter, and how Taizu’s successor Taizong spread Buddhist truth with his keen understanding and eloquence. He is especially praiseworthy of the current emperor, Zhenzong, to whose reign title...
(jingde 景德) the Chuandeng lu is dedicated, for his personal devotion to Buddhism and his role in spreading the “transforming message of the perfect and sudden” (yuandun zhi hua 圓頓之化) (i.e., Chan) throughout China. It is clear from this that Yang Yi saw in Chan a new style of Buddhist teaching, “practiced separately, apart from scriptural teachings,” that did not bear culpability for the preceding turmoil and could serve as a distinguishing feature of Song culture. The association of Chan with the names of Song emperors in a document written and approved by imperial sanction makes clear the intended status of Chan in imperial policy.

As mentioned earlier, Yang Yi’s attraction to Chan was driven by motivation to promote a new style of wen in the Song dynasty, one that distinguished itself from Tang predecessors. His advocacy of Chan as “a separate practice outside the teaching” in the Chuandeng lu coincided with a literary model that distinguished Song civilization. Yang Yi’s strategy for the Chuandeng lu may be highlighted with the compilation strategies of the Song emperors. Emperor Taizong sponsored great Song encyclopedic works, and according to Johannes L. Kurz, one of the aims for the compilation projects promoted under Taizong was to link the Song with the Tang by imitating the latter’s accomplishments in the literary field. As mentioned previously, Buddhist works sponsored by Taizong fit this model of validating Song authority through imitation of established literary conventions, and Taizong’s successor Zhenzong was persuaded to seek models of literary uniqueness. Yang Yi’s attraction to Chan fit this ambition. He was especially enthralled with Linji Chan and its celebrated unique rhetorical style that offered a contrast to the traditionalist-style of Chan as compatible with Buddhist scriptures, advocated by Fayan faction masters in Wuyue.

44 Commonly referred to as the Four Great Books of the Song Dynasty introduced above: the Taiping yulan 太平御覽, a general-purpose leishu 頻書 encyclopedia; the Taiping guangji 太平廣記, a collection of deities, fairies, ghost stories and theology; the Wenyuan yinghua 文苑英華, an anthology of poetry, odes, songs and other writings; and the Cefu yuangui 冊府元龜, a leishu encyclopedia of political essays, autobiographies, memorials and decrees.


46 Yang Yi personified the renewed interest in literary culture at the Song court, especially the dedication to literary sophistication as a means to demonstrate knowledge of China’s cultural inheritance and direct this in appropriate forms suitable to the present (Peter K. Bol, “This Culture of Ours”, 148–175). In other words, rather than follow a strict guwen agenda that restricted expression to approved forms, Yang Yi inclined toward innovation on the basis of established
Evidence suggests that Yang Yi applied his newly acquired admiration for Linji Chan to the *Jingde Chuandeng lu*. According to Yang Yi, after the emperor received Daoyuan’s text, he commissioned Yang Yi, Li Wei 李維 (*jinshi* 985), and Wang Shu 王曙 (963–1034) to edit it completely, deleting and amending portions to determine the final version. Yang Yi and his cohorts worked on Daoyuan’s text for nearly a year, and although they regarded the work with high praise, they also found reason to make alterations. As Yang Yi stipulates in his *Preface*, the “Old Record” (*jiulu* 舊錄) of Daoyuan (referring to the *Fozu tongcan ji*) was subjected to revision.

Moreover, the documentation of actual events surely depends on skillful narration [to be effective]. For words to travel far [and be transmitted to future generations], they cannot lack literary elegance (*wen*). In this regard, in recording the circumstances of events and relating in detail the traces of the course taken, the [*Old*] Record in some cases ordered the words confusingly and in some cases the language used was coarse—all of this we deliberately removed in order to make it of imperial quality. In either case, we amended or eliminated it in order to make what it says consistent. And when it comes to dialogues with

patterns. His goal, and the goal of the early Song, was to construct a new model for Chinese culture, indebted to past precedents, but also free of past limitations. The Tang represented a glorious legacy, to be sure, but it was ultimately flawed in Song eyes. Care had to be taken to avoid those problems that had plagued Tang rule, which had disintegrated into warlordism and civil unrest. A new basis for culture had to be imagined. Yang Yi played an instrumental role in this enterprise, and Chan played an important purpose in Yang Yi’s conception of the new cultural paradigm.

48 Ishii, 23b11–12; trans., 10. For the biographies of Li Wei (*jinshi* 985) and Wang Shu (963–1034) see SS 262.9541–9542 & 286.9632–9636. Li Wei assisted in the editing work of the *Cefu yuangui*. Wang Shu compiled works on a variety of subjects, including the *Zhou shu* 周書 (Book of Zhou), the *Zhuangzi* 莊子, and *Liezi* 列子.
49 Paraphrasing a line attributed to Confucius in the *Zuo zhuan* 左傳. As cited in Ouyang Xiu’s *Wenzhong ji* 文忠集 68 in *Jushi waiji* 居士外集 18 it reads, with commentary: 《傳》曰：「言之無文，行而不遠。」君子之所學也。言以載事，而文以飾言，事信言文，乃能表見於後世。The *Zuo zhuan* says: “Words that are not written down do not travel far” is [a phrase] that is learned by the Junzi. When recording matters that have been spoken in writing, the written text is used to embellish what was spoken, and the matters are faithfully conveyed in word and text. As a result, [the Junzi] is able to express them clearly to later generation.” https://ctext.org/wiki.pl?if=gb&chapter=83792 (3).
Confucian officials and lay gentleman, or those who are illustrious in their rank of nobility or family name, we checked their dates for errors and consulted historical records for inaccuracies, eliminating all of them in order to make what it transmits trustworthy.\(^{50}\)

How extensive the revisions were to the “Old Record” is unclear.\(^{51}\) Yang Yi claims that they succeeded in adapting large portions of it, while intentionally appending material to enhance it.\(^{52}\) How far the editing went beyond more cosmetic matters like cleaning up prose, correcting dates, etc., to ensure the work was of “imperial quality” (lunguan 綸貫) remains a matter of conjecture.\(^{53}\) What effect these alterations had on the content and organization of the work likewise remains unknown. At the very least it suggests that the Jingde Chuandeng lu, far from directly conveying the conversations and sermons of famous masters, represents a highly filtered version of these, tailored to presumptions of imperial standards. At the other extreme is the suggestion that Yang Yi and his associates assumed a very active role and seriously altered the text’s contents to conform to their own understanding of Chan. What is known is that Yang Yi did more than simply edit the existing text. Dispersed throughout the Jingde Chuandeng lu text are dated references

\(^{50}\) Ishii, 23b2–5; trans., 10.

\(^{51}\) The comments here and following derive from Monks, Rulers, and Literati, 180–181.

\(^{52}\) As Yang Yi states later in the preface (Ishii, 23b10): “Nonetheless, what was recorded in the Old Record sometimes picked up vulgar expressions and omitted refined ones. Depending on surviving materials contained in separate collections, we proceeded to investigate the contents of these text to restore deficiencies.” (然而舊錄所載，或掇粗而遺精，別集具存，當尋文而補闕。).

\(^{53}\) The expression lunguan 綸貫 literally refers to stringing together (in this case a book) with silk thread, indicating a work of special status. As the work was commissioned by the emperor, I read it as an indication of quality suitable for the audience for which it was intended. For analogues, see lunyan 綸言, lunzhi 綸旨, and lunshu 綸書, where lun in each case refers to an imperial announcement, proclamation, or order.
subsequent to Daoyuan’s completion date, the first year of jingde (1004), making it clear that Yang Yi was responsible for additions to the text.\(^5^4\)

The main editions of the Jingde Chuandeng lu are the Tōji 東寺 edition and the Sibu congkan 四部叢刊 (The Four Branches of Literature Collection) edition.\(^5^5\) The Tōji edition refers to the Northern Song publication of the Jingde Chuandeng lu issued from the Dongchan (East Chan) Monastery 東禅寺 in Fuzhou in the third year of yuanli (1080), in the possession of Tōji in Kyoto.\(^5^6\) It represents the oldest complete version of the Chuandeng lu currently known. The oldest extant version of the Sibu congkan edition of the Chuandeng lu was issued in the third year of yanyou (1316), in the Yuan dynasty. This version is the basis of the Chuandeng lu text contained in the Taishō shinshu daizōkyō Japanese edition of the Buddhist canon issued between 1914 and 1922, the standard source cited in modern scholarship.\(^5^7\) Neither the Dongchan nor Sibu congkan editions are faithful renditions of the oldest edited compilation issued by Yang Yi.\(^5^8\) While the particulars remain unknown, we know from Yang Yi’s own comments that his compilation originally included the names of 1,760 people associated with Chan, of which 1,169 had entries recorded. Both the Dongchan and Sibu congkan editions include the names of 1,709 people, 966 with entries. This means that Yang Yi’s compilation included 51 more people in total and, of even greater significance, 203 more with entries.\(^5^9\) Even Yang Yi’s own stipulation of the number of names included in

\(^{5^4}\) Shiina Kōyū, Sōgenhan zenseki no kenkyū 宋元版禅籍の研究, 174–175, citing Ishii Shūdō, “Keitoku dentōroku no rekishiteki seikaku (shita)” 「景徳伝燈録」の歴史的性格（下）.

\(^{5^5}\) The Sibu congkan is a large collection of the main works of the Chinese scholarly tradition, arranged by the four branches (sibu) into which literature in China was traditionally divided: jing (classics), shi (history), zi (philosophers), and ji (belles-lettres).

\(^{5^6}\) A copy of this edition has been published by Yanagdia Seizan, ed., Sōhan kōribon, Keitoku dentōroku.

\(^{5^7}\) T 2076, 51.

\(^{5^8}\) The only known fragments of Yang Yi’s original edition are contained in the Oldenburg collection of Dunhuang manuscripts in the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Russian Academy of Sciences in St. Petersburg, comprising 371 lines mostly from the middle to the end of fascicle 11 (Nishiguchi Yoshio, “Tōzenji han Keitoku dentōroku kaidai” 東禅寺版「景徳伝灯録」解題, Zenbunka kenkyūjo, 6a). My discussion here derives from Monks, Rulers, and Literati, 117.

\(^{5^9}\) The numbers of people included in Yang Yi’s compilation of the Jingde Chuandeng lu are based on Yang Yi’s own fascicle descriptions of the contents in Dazhong xiangfu Fabao lu 大中祥符法寶錄, contained in Songzang yizhen 宋藏遺珍, a collection of texts from Song editions of the Buddhist canon. My
his preface to the *Chuandeng lu* is not the same in all versions. The Dongchan and Sibu congkan editions stipulate 1,701, while the Korean edition states 1,721. This suggests that not only were the contents of the *Chuandeng lu* altered, but Yang Yi’s preface was subject to revision as well.

While we do not know the names of those expunged from the record, we do know the fascicles from which the eradications took place. Fascicle 4 of the *Chuandeng lu* devotes considerable attention to the collateral Niutou 牛頭 (Oxhead) lineage descended from Daoxin 道信, charted through six generations (Niutou Farong 牛頭法融, Zhiyan 智巖, Huifang 慧方, Fachi 法持, Zhiwei 智威, and Huizhong 慧忠). In total, the names of seventy-six masters are mentioned in association with the Niutou faction, seventeen with records included. Fascicle 4 also includes the records of collateral lineages descended from the fifth Chinese patriarch Hongren 弘忍. In addition to the “main line” of Chan transmission through Huineng 慧能, a total of one hundred and seven names are listed as descendants of Hongren through thirteen other disciples. Of these thirteen, three have records in the *Chuandeng lu*: Shenxiu 神秀, Preceptor of State Huian 慧安, and Daoming 道明. The most prolific lineage documented is Shenxiu’s “northern school.” Shenxiu is credited with 19 heirs. The only other disciple of Hongren credited with heirs is Huian with 18. Shenxiu’s disciple, Puji 普寂, is credited with 46 heirs in the third generation. In total, the collateral lineages of Hongren listed in the *Chuandeng lu* are documented through five generations, with one hundred and seven names mentioned. Roughly 70% of these are connected with the “northern school.”

Of the one-hundred seven names mentioned, only twelve have records. There is good reason to believe that this was not originally the case. Fascicles three and four, taken collectively, are one area of the *Chuandeng lu* where a discrepancy is found between the total number of people Yang Yi claims he

---

60 T 2076, 51:196c5; Yanagida Seizan, ed., *Sōhan, kōribon Keitoku dentōroku* 宋版高麗本「景德傳燈録」解題, 6a–10b (see especially the comparative chart on 8a).
63 T 2076, 51:231b12–232a24.
64 T 2076, 51:231b11–235a7.
listed in his original publication and the numbers given in existing editions. According to Yang Yi, fascicles three and four mentioned 13 more names than those listed in existing editions (221, as opposed to 208). More significantly, however, is the discrepancy in the number of records associated with the people listed in these fascicles. According to Yang Yi, fascicles three and four contained the records of 204 people, a whopping 168 more than the 36 records contained in existing editions. Since fascicle three concerns the records of the standard, if obscure, early Chinese Chan patriarchs (Bodhidharma through Hongren), this is not likely to be a major source for the discrepancies. It accounts for only 8 of the 208 names mentioned in fascicles three and four in existing editions. Fascicle four, which documents the collateral Niutou and Northern School lineages, rivals to the claim of orthodoxy otherwise reserved for the Southern School, would appear as the likely place where some names and numerous records were deleted. If this is indeed the case, the *Chuandeng lu* was even more devoted to the principle of inclusiveness then existing editions of the text reveal. Moreover, the deletion of names and records from the *Chuandeng lu* speaks again to the contested nature of Chan orthodoxy in the early Song, where the Linji faction insisted on shaping an interpretation of Chan that increasingly marginalized rival views.

The point to remember is that not only was Daoyuan’s compilation altered through Yang Yi’s editorial work, Yang Yi’s original edition of the *Chuandeng lu* was also subject to revision, and none of the editions in current existence represent faithful transmissions of Yang Yi’s original published version. The fact that the text was reworked by later hands attests to the contested nature of Chan in the early Song.

Yang Yi’s understanding of Chan reflected the evolving circumstances of Buddhism at the Song court. The clearest evidence for the way Yang Yi’s changing Chan preferences paralleled shifting influences is contained in the record of Yang Yi included in the *Tiansheng Guangdeng lu* 天聖廣燈錄, the successor to the *Jingde Chuandeng lu* compiled by another famous literati figure, Li Zunxu 李遵勗, in 1029. The record is comprised of a letter sent by Yang Yi to Li Wei explaining the evolution of his Chan preferences with a brief history of those he counted as his teachers. The letter was apparently written by Yang Yi in 1015, as administrator in Ruzhou 汝州. It relates how he was first

---

65 Based on Yang Yi’s summary of the *Chuandeng lu* contained in the *Dazhong xiangfu Fabao lu* (see Nishiguchi, “Tōzenji han Keitoku dentōroku kaidai,” 8a).
66 The text of the letter is contained in GDL 18 (X 1553, 78: 511c5–512a1); it was appended, along with the other material contained in the GDL record of Yang Yi,
introduced to the teachings of the Southern School while studying in the capital, and how he received instruction from two masters, one by the name of Great Master An (Angong dashi) and the other named Great Master Liang of Yunmen (Yunmen Lianggong dashi). Yang Yi stipulates how the teachings of both An and Liang agreed with each other, as both were members of the Fayan lineage, having trained at the Guizong and Yunzhu monasteries on Mt. Lu.

Even as a young ignorant fool, I appreciated and cared for [things that mattered]. Once I heard the message of the Southern School, I made the long sojourn to the capital. Between movement and stillness, I sought out advice. Through my consultations with others, I was urged on. It enabled me to reach out with an open heart, and as one unashamed to face the wall [like Bodhidharma]. I sincerely went out [to practice] among the straw mats and beneath the raised platforms [in the mediation hall]. I am truly indebted to you for this, and even more to my great teacher, Master An, who regularly imparted to me instruction and guidance. Following the one who entered nirvāṇa under the pair of sala trees, and the single-sandalied one returned to the western regions, [Master An passed away]. I was overwhelmed with grief and had no one

to the Yuan edition of the CDL), following fascicle 30 (T 2076, 51:464a27–465b5).

Based on the suggestion of a reviewer, I follow the punctuation there. Ruzhou is located in present day Henan province, Lin’an prefecture.

67 The simple phrase, dongjing 動靜 (literally “movement and stillness”) is replete with implications, as an example of the paradigmatic pairing of basic ontological impulses in East Asian thought: a state of pristine mental purity and the disturbance of this purity through as affected by contacts with external things. In Buddhist contexts, it may refer to original enlightenment and the appearance of ignorance with the first movement of mind. Perhaps here it can be read as a contrast between Yang Yi’s awareness of the stillness (the enlightened state) and the agitation that propels his search. For fuller explanation, see Charles Muller, DDB http://www.buddhism-dict.net/cgi-bin/xpr-ddb.pl?q=動靜.

68 The phrase kuxin 剖心 (to open the mind/heart) is found in Zhuangzi: “The Master said, 'It is the Dao that overspreads and sustains all things. How great It is in Its overflowing influence! The Superior man ought by all means to remove from his mind (all that is contrary to It).’” (Legge, trans., https://ctext.org/dictionary.pl?if=gb&it=2786#s10027927; italics added).

69 Reference to qiangmian 牆面 (face the wall) is also found in Analects (Lunyu) 17–10, where it refers pejoratively to someone who does not study, and therefore is ignorant, but the reference to Bodhidharma facing the wall during prolonged meditation seems more appropriate in this context.
with whom to stay [to continue my practice]. I passed the year plagued with a long illness, my spirit depressed, confused and disappointed. Nevertheless, as my condition began to improve, I once again understood the course I needed to take. Then Master Liang of Mt. Yunmen,70 a great being, deigned to look after a common rustic [like myself]. The message of Master Liang was exactly the same as Master An’s. Moreover, he had come from the Guizong [Monastery] on Mt. Lu and from Mt. Yunju.71 Both were disciples of Fayan [Wenyi].72

Unfortunately, we have no information on Master An or Master Liang, other than the mention of their names here. They do not appear in the Jingde Chuandeng lu in spite of the fact that their affiliation with Fayan Wenyi should have made them familiar to Tiantai Deshao, and presumably Daoyuan. What is important is Yang Yi claimed an affiliation with the Fayan lineage through them, and that Yang Yi’s introduction to Chan teaching came via instruction from Fayan lineage masters. As noted above, Yang Yi received a commission to serve as Prefect in Chuzhou 处州 (Zhejiang) in the first year of xianping (998).73 This provided the occasion for Yang Yi’s interaction with Fayan lineage masters. In spite of the depth of his Fayan lineage associations, a subsequent appointment

70 Mt. Yunmen is located in Shaozhou, in Guangdong province. There is also a mountain by this name in Qingzhou, Shandong province. It is not clear to me why a Fayan lineage master came to be associated with a monastery closely aligned with the Yunmen faction.

71 Guizong Monastery 歸宗寺 is located at the foot of Mt. Lu in contemporary Jiangxi province. Mt. Yunju 雲居山 may refer to a mountain in Jiangxi, as well as a monastery of the same name, or the area near West Lake in Hangzhou where Lingyin and Tianzhu monasteries, Feilaifeng grottoes, and other Buddhist sites are located.

72 X 1553, 78: 511c7–13; Ishii trans., 17.

73 SS 305.10080.7–8; concerning the biography of Yang Yi, see Fujiyoshi Masumi, “Jōjin to Yōmonkō dan’en” 成尋と楊文公談苑.
caused Yang Yi to switch to Linji Chan interpretations. Yang Yi’s letter to Li Wei continues:

Last year, when I was appointed Acting Prefect of this prefecture (Ruzhou, in Henan province), I met the senior Chan monk Guanghui [Yuanlian]. In fact, Yuanlian is the successor of Nanyuan [Xing]nian; [Xing]nian succeeded Fengxue [Yanzhao]; Fengxue succeeded Nanyuan [Huiyong]; Nanyuan succeeded Xinghua [Cunjiang]; Xinghua succeeded Linji [Yixuan]; Linji succeeded Huangbo [Xiyun]; Huangbo succeeded Baizhang [Huaihai]; Huaihai succeeded Mazu [Daoyi]; Mazu succeeded Venerable Rang [Nanyue Huairang]; [Venerable] Rang was the eldest heir of Caoxi [Huineng].

After I performed the simple tasks of the prefecture office, I returned home with ample leisure at my disposal. Sometimes I welcomed Yuanlian to my home; sometimes I ordered a carriage to go to his place. I invited him [to my home] and visited [his residence] without restraint, and my accumulated encumbrances suddenly began to dissipate.

After half a year I was completely free of all doubts. It was as if I suddenly remembered what had been forgotten, like abruptly awakening from sleep. Past concerns which I had been attached to I discarded at once, without so much as a thought. Matters that I had failed to understand for many years appeared distinctly before my eyes. Indeed, how much more decisive were my judgements, and I dealt with matters without any hesitation whatsoever.

The contents of the two prefaces, written ca. 1004–1008, suggest that Yang Yi’s perspective on Chan had already shifted Fayan to Linji faction influences. Why the admission is only coming in a letter to Li Wei written in 1015 is a question for which I currently have no answer.
In spite of Yang Yi’s early affiliation with Fayan lineage masters and their teachings, he ultimately saw himself as a member of the Linji faction, the Dharma-heir of Guanghui Yuanlian (951–1036), whom he met in Ruzhou (Henan) and whose lineage he traced back through a series of masters to Caoxi Huineng.

[Generation from Bodhidharma] Yang Yi’s Dharma Lineage

[6] Caoxi Huineng 曹谿慧能
[10] Huangbo Xiyun 黃檗希雲 (?–850)
[12] Xinghua Cunjiang 興化存獎 (830–888)
[14] Fengxue Yanzhao 風穴延沼 (896–973)
[15] Shoushan Xingnian 首山省念 (926–993)
[16] Guanghui Yuanlian 廣慧元璉 (951–1036)

76 Baizhang Huaihai’s 百丈懷海 record is found in SGSZ 10 (T 2061, 50: 770c–771a), ZTJ 14 (55.4–65.12), CDL 6 (T 2076, 51: 249b–251b), GDL 8 (X 1553, 78:450b–451c) & 9 (456b–464b); see also QTW 446 (4548–4549) for his epitaph.
77 Huangbo Xiyun’s 黃檗希雲 record is found in SGSZ 20 (T 2061, 50: 842b–843c), ZTJ 16 (131.6–137.6), CDL 9 (T 2976, 51: 266a–c), GDL 8 (X 1553, 78:451c–456a).
78 Linji Yixuan’s 臨際義玄 record is found in CDL 12 (T 2076, 51: 290a–291a), GDL 10 & 11 (X 1553, 78:464b–474c).
79 Xinghua Cunjiang’s 興化存獎 record is found in CDL 12 (T 2076, 51: 295b), GDL 12 (X 1553, 78:476c–478a).
80 Nanyuan Huiyong 南院慧顒 (a.k.a. Baoying)’s record is found in CDL 12 (T 2076, 51: 298b–305c), GDL 14 (X 1553, 78:485b–487b).
81 Fengxue Yanzhao’s 風穴延沼 record is found in CDL 13 (T 2076, 51: 302b–303c), GDL 15 (X 1553, 78:488b–493b).
82 Shoushan Xingnian’s 首山省念 record is found in CDL 13 (T 2076, 51: 304a–305a), GDL 16 (X 1553, 78:493c–495a).
83 Guanghui Yuanlian’s 廣慧元璉 record is found in GDL 17 (X 1553, 78:502a–b); see also CDL 13 (T 2076, 51: 304a).
Yang Yi’s experience with Guanghui Yuanlian affirmed his Chan preference for the descendants of Mazu Daoyi’s Hongzhou faction, currently named for Linji Yixuan, whose lineage became increasingly strong at the Song court. The inclusion of Yang Yi’s record in the Tiansheng Guangdeng lu, a work devoted to promoting the Linji faction, substantiates this claim. As noted above, Yang Yi’s letter to Li Wei was later attached to some editions of the Jingde Chuandeng lu so as to connect Yang Yi’s change of factional affiliation to the work he helped edit. 84

In his “conversion” to Linji faction Chan, Yang Yi claims that “accumulated encumbrances suddenly began to dissipate,” and he became “completely free of all doubts.” In the manner of one who encounters great awakening, he likens his experience to “suddenly remembering what had been forgotten,” and “abruptly awakening from sleep.” Attachments were discarded, what had been previously unclear became understood. This conversion was predicated on his taking the new position in Ruzhou (Henan), where he had occasion to meet Guanghui Yuanlian. According to the Song shi, Yang Yi received his new appointment in the seventh year of dazhong xiangfu (1014), some five years after the edited Jingde Chuandeng lu was finally issued. 85 This would preclude the possibility that Yang Yi’s “conversion” radically altered the contents of the Chuandeng lu to coincide with his new-found realization. During the time that he was responsible for editing the Chuandeng lu, Yang Yi was by his own admission still under the sway of Fayan faction masters. Emblematic of Yang Yi’s Fayan style approach is his Fayuan wen 發願文 (Text on Issuing the Vow), a declaration written prior to his meeting with Guanghui Yuanlian to express his Buddhist faith and commitment to Bodhisattva vows. 86 Nevertheless, his interpretation of Chan, as exhibited in his preface to the Jingde Chuandeng lu reviewed above, was clearly moving in a direction associated with Linji Chan interpretation. Given the role that Chan assumed in Yang Yi’s promotion of wen as creative and spontaneous expression, it was perhaps inevitable that Yang Yi would eventually align himself with Linji Chan rhetoric and the innovative prose it inspired.

84 See, for example, the Yuan edition (issued in 1316), Jingde Chuandeng lu (Taipei: Xinwenfeng, 1988), 645–647.
85 SS 305.10083.
Who was Guanghui Yuanlian, the master whose influence left a lasting mark on Yang Yi’s understanding of Chan? Guanghui Yuanlian hailed from the Pujiang 普江 region of Quanzhou 泉州, and studied there under Zhaoqing Xingdeng 招慶省僜 (aka Wendeng 文僜), the master behind the compilation of the Zutang ji 祖堂記. Yuanlian is said to have visited over fifty masters in the region but did not experience enlightenment until he went north and met Shoushan Xingnian in Ruzhou. Yuanlian’s experience in the south undoubtedly helped him persuade Yang Yi about the superiority of Mazu and Linji lineage Chan that prevailed in Ruzhou and the north. Yuanlian’s influence also extended to other high-ranking officials. In 1004, when Yuanlian began instructing at Guanghui Monastery in Ruzhou, the high-ranking official (Vice Grand Councilor, Participant in Determining Governmental Matters) Wang Shu 王曙 was released from his duties as Supervising Secretary, where he handled all manner of important imperial correspondences and policies, and was made administrator of nearby Ruyang. The record of a Chan style dialogue that took place between Wang Shu and Yuanlian at this time is indicative of a close personal relationship between them. As noted above, Wang Shu assisted Yang Yi in editing the Jingde Chuandeng lu, along with Li Wei. Upon his death in 1036, Yuanlian was honored with the title “Chan master of True Wisdom” (zhenhui chanshi 真慧禪師). He was later acclaimed by Xiaoying 晓瑩 (d.u.), compiler of the Luohu yelu 羅湖野錄, as the only master envied by both

---

87 The details of Guanghui Yuanlian’s life provided here are taken from the Luohu yelu 羅湖野錄 (X 1577, 83:387b19–c17), compiled by Xiaoying 晓瑩 in 1141.


89 Ishii, Sōdai zenshūshi, 20, argues that the meeting between Wang Shu and Yuanlian must have occurred sometime after 1020, shortly after the discovery of Zhou Huaizheng’s 周懷政 plot to kill Ding Wei 丁謂, and Zhou Huaizheng’s subsequent execution. Wang Shu was implicated because his wife was the daughter of the Grand Councilor Kou Zhun 宰相寇準, who was associated with Zhou Huaizheng, whom Zhou Huaizheng petitioned to restore to the office of Grand Councilor. Wang Shu was dismissed and sent to Ruzhou as a result.

90 The dialogue, recorded in the Luohu yelu (X 1577, 83:387b19–c17), recounts how Yuanlian went to Wang Shu’s district administrative office, observed him at work, and asked him what the key was to his decision-making as magistrate. Wang Shu replied that he decided things as they were presented. Yuanlian then asked what he would do if all of a sudden nothing was presented, at which point Wang Shu threw his writing brush at Yuanlian.
Buddhist masters and elite and illustrious officials during the jingde era (1004–1007). Yang Yi felt self-conscious enough about his switch of allegiance to provide justification. He contends that his interest in exploring Chan continued unabated with visits to numerous Chan masters. He felt no restrictions imposed by past factional allegiances and justifies his continued curiosity by citing the record of previous masters, Xuefeng 雪峰, Linji 臨濟, Yungan 雲巖, and Danxia 丹霞. Yang Yi’s self-conscious need to justify his switch of allegiance in this way may tell us much about the atmosphere surrounding Chan at the time. Had the decision to switch not been momentous, there would have been no need to rationalize in this way. After all, were Fayan and Linji not but two legitimate factions of the same Chan movement? Yang Yi’s change from Fayan to Linji allegiance suggests that there was much more at stake than simple factional affiliation. What Yang Yi was sanctioning was a very different understanding of Chan promoted by the Linji faction, and one that had considerable consequences for the way Chan was interpreted in the Song dynasty and beyond. Yet, one must be cautious in assessing Yang Yi’s role here. Yang Yi may not have been so much instigating as confirming how the new Linji style Chan would be validated at the Song court. The dominance of the Linji faction at

91 Luohu yelu (X 1577, 83:387b19–c17). Guanghui Yuanlian had close ties to other Song literati, as well. In addition to Yang Yi and Wang Shu, Yuanlian received visits from Administrative Secretary (zhengshu) Wang Can 王參 and Palace Ordinant (zhongshi) Xu Lang 許郎 and was honored with a poem by Ding Pu 丁普. The biography of Guanghui Yuanlian is contained in the Chanlin sengbao zhuan 禪林僧寶傳, fascicle 16 (X 1560 79:506a15–507b3). Yuanlian also has records in GDL 17 (X 1553, 78.502a-b) and Xu Chuandeng lu 續傳燈錄 1 (T 2077, 51:472b–c), but these contain only yulu fragments and no biographical information.

92 X 1553, 78:511c21–24; Ishii, 18, states: Xuefeng visited Dongshan nine times, and Touzi three times, before finally succeeding Deshan. Linji obtained the Dharma from Dayu, but in the end succeeded Huangbo. While Yungan often received instruction from Daowu, he became the heir of Yaoshan. While Danxia personally received certification from Mazu, he still became the heir of Shitou. In the past [examples like this] frequently occurred; in principle there is nothing disagreeable about it.

93 I am in agreement with Mark Halperin, who upon reading the draft of this paper commented: “There seems to be some tension between Yang's prefaces”
the Song court was already a fact. In sanctioning it, Yang Yi merely affirmed what had already occurred, seeing in it an opportunity to link it to a new “Song style” wen. Yang Yi’s own biography parallels the changes occurring in early Song Chan and he, more than any other figure, was responsible for establishing the interpretation of Chan as “a separate transmission outside the teaching” in official circles.94

In fact, Yang Yi was but one of a group of prestigious Song literati who formed close links with Linji masters. Other prominent figures include Liu Yun 刘筠 (971–1031), who, according to the Tiansheng Guangdeng lu, was on close terms with Chan master Yuncong 蘆聰 of Mt. Guyin 谷隱山 in Xiangzhou 襄州 (Hubei), along with Yang Yi.95 Like Yang Yi, Liu Yun was appointed to the prestigious Hanlin Academy. Likewise, Liu Yun is also credited with initiating the Song literary style, albeit one that was later rejected by Neo-Confucians as too ornate.96 Nonetheless, he played a formative role in initiating the revival of Confucianism. At the bidding of emperor Zhenzong, Liu Yun began to collect the literary works of various Confucian authors. This collection served as the canon for Confucian studies for the generation of Liu’s contemporaries. A personal acquaintance of Liu’s, Zhenzong delighted in his poems, odes, and songs. Liu Yun also participated in the compilation of the Cefu yuangui, the encyclopedic project for which Yang Yi served as a chief editor.97

Both Yuanlian and Yuncong were among the disciples of the prominent master Shoushan Xingnian (926–993) of the Baoying Chan Cloister in Ruzhou (Henan). According to the epitaph of Yuncong composed by Li Zunxu, the

affirming" the state of affairs at court and Yang being "responsible" for this new view of Chan. Frankly, I would lean toward the latter, if only because no other figure comes close to him and other sources suggest that he had a forceful personality.”

94 There is also a preface attributed to Yang Yi written for the Chan monastic code attributed to Baizhang Huaihai, Chixiu Baizhang qinggui xu 彪修百丈清規序 (CBETA X 2025, 48:1157c23–1158b6). In the Song, Baizhang was heralded for his contribution to Chan’s institutional independence. See Foulk, “The “Chan School” and Its Place in the Buddhist Monastic Tradition.”


96 Their “ornate style” was criticized by Zhu Xi as inferior (Peter Bol, This Culture of Ours, 29). This criticism is also implicit in comments in the introduction to the collected biographies of literary men from the Song shi, where it states that “At the beginning of the dynasty, Yang Yi and Liu Yun were still imitating the tonal rules of Tang writers” (SS 439.12997; trans. adapted from Bol, 150).

97 SS 305.10088–10089.
Guangdeng lu was compiled expressly to document the achievements of Xingnian and his disciples.\textsuperscript{98} The composition of the Guangdeng lu is thus closely tied to the interpretation of Chan that this group of Linji lineage masters and their literary patrons wished to project.

**Conclusion**

The differing perspectives of Yang Yi’s prefaces to the *Anthology of the Shared Practices of Buddhas and Patriarchs* (*Fozu tongcan ji*) and to the *Record of the Transmission of the Lamp compiled in the Jingde era* (*Jingde Chuandeng lu*) are reflected in the justification for his conversion from Fayan faction to Linji faction Chan recorded in his letter to Li Wei in the *Expanded Lamp Record compiled in the Tiansheng era* (*Tiansheng Guangdeng lu*). The conversion and change of perspective, in turn, reflect a monumental change in the favored interpretation of Chan at the Song Dynasty court. Yang Yi was the leading figure who precipitated this change. This confirms the importance of literati in promoting Chan at the Song Dynasty Court, and the central role played by Yang Yi in the creation Chan identity.

The three documents pertaining to Yang Yi are translated in full in the appendix that follows.

**Appendix**

**Translations**

1. Preface to the *Anthology of the Shared Practices of Buddhas and Patriarchs* 佛祖同參集序
2. Preface to the *Record of the Transmission of the Lamp compiled in the Jingde era* 景德傳燈錄序
3. Entry on Yang Yi in the *Expanded Lamp Record compiled in the Tiansheng era* 天聖廣燈錄

\textsuperscript{98} A copy of the epitaph is appended to the end of Yuncong’s record in the GDL (X 1553, 78:501a9–b20; see especially 501b16–17).
Preface to the Anthology of the Shared Practices of Buddhas and Patriarchs

佛祖同參集序

I.

Formerly, the Tathāgata personally received the prediction of enlightenment from Dīpankara Buddha. In reality, there is no Dharma whatsoever that can be attained. He was known as Śākyamuni, the Great Awakened One. Hereafter, his wisdom thrived greatly, and his mind of compassion became apparent. Thinking of the debased state [of sentient beings] resulting from the four kinds of birth and the never-ending cycle of existence through the six destinies, he incarnated in human form in the world of the five turbidities, for the one

99 Yang Yi’s Fozu tongcan ji Preface is contained in his collected works, Wuyi xinji 武夷新集 7: 24a-26b in Siku quanshu zhenben 8; Ishii 21a–23a.

100 The four ways that living beings are born into in the three realms and six destinies [DDB]: (1) Oviparous (born from eggs) 卵生 (Skt. andaŋa-yonī); all beings born from eggs, such as birds, reptiles, fish, and insects. (2) Viviparous 胎生 (Skt. jarāyuja-yoni, Pāli jalābu-ja); creatures that are born from the womb—all mammals. (3) Born from moisture 濕生 (Skt. saṃvedajā-yoni, Pāli saṃseda-ja); also understood as born from causes and conditions 因緣生, or born as the result of the combination of heat and cold 寒熱和合生; includes insects and other smaller life forms for which eggs were not readily detectible. (4) Metamorphic, or born through transformation, born spontaneously 化生 (Skt. upapādakā-yoni, Pāli opapātikā); for example, celestials 天, hell denizens 地獄, etc. all of whom are born according to their prior karma.

101 The six kinds of rebirth in cyclic existence [DDB]: 地獄趣 narakā-gati, or that of the hells; 饑鬼趣 preta-gati, of hungry ghosts; 畜生趣 tiryagyoni-gati, of animals; 阿修羅趣 asura-gati, of malevolent nature spirits; 人趣 manusya-gati, of human existence; 天趣 deva-gati, of deva existence.

102 To be incarnated in human form refers to the emanation body (nirmānakāya) of the Buddha that appears in the world to teach people the path to liberation. The Five Turbidities (a.k.a. the Five Corruptions, Five Defilements, Five Depravities, Five Filths, or Five Impurities) refer to conditions of a kalpa in decay: 1. The defilement of views, when incorrect, perverse thoughts and ideas are predominant. 2. The defilement of passions, when all kinds of transgressions are exalted. 3. The defilement of the human condition, when people are usually dissatisfied and unhappy. 4. The defilement of the life-span, when the human life-span as a whole decreases. 5. The defilement of the world-age, when war and natural disasters are rife. From a Buddhist point of view, the Five turbidities may constitute aids to Enlightenment, as they may spur practitioners to more earnest cultivation.
[great] cause alone.\textsuperscript{103}

昔如來于然燈佛所，親䝉記莂。實無少法可得。是號大覺能仁。既而後智滋興，悲心顯發。念四生之沉溺，輪迴六趣之中，為一事之因緣，岀現五濁之世。

How different their individual capacities were, and his responses were distinct [in each case]. It is the reason he [initiated various approaches]: developing the gateways of the three vehicles and the expedient and the true, provisionally establishing the teachings of the sudden and the gradual at the same time, implementing the doctrine of the relative and the all-embracing, the partial and the complete, and distinguishing between awakening and realization and subduing and severing [of desire?].

奈何根器各異。機感有殊，繇是開三乘權實之門，設一時頓漸之教，具偏圓半滿之義，分悟證伏㫁之差。

Explanations of it formed the Buddhist canon in twelve divisions,\textsuperscript{104} and elaborations of it formed hundreds of thousands of hymns of praise; each and

\textsuperscript{103} The phrase 為一事之因緣 (for one [great] cause alone) derives from fascicle 1 of the Lotus Sūtra: "This Dharma is not a thing that discursive or discriminatory reasoning can understand. Only Buddhas can know it. What is the reason? The Buddhas, the World-Honored Ones, for one great cause alone appear in the world. Sariputra, what do I mean by 'The Buddhas, the World-Honored Ones, for one great cause alone appear in the world?' The Buddhas, the World-Honored Ones, appear in the world because they wish to cause the beings to hear of the Buddha's knowledge and insight and thus enable them to gain purity. They appear in the world because they wish to demonstrate the Buddha's knowledge and insight to the beings. They appear in the world because they wish to cause the beings to understand. They appear in the world because they wish to cause the beings to enter into the path of the Buddha's knowledge and insight. Sariputra, this is the one great cause for which the Buddhas appear in the world."

\textsuperscript{104} The Twelve Divisions of the Mahayana Canon are: \textit{sūtra}—the Buddha’s sermons, \textit{geya}—metrical pieces, \textit{gāthā}—poems or chants, \textit{nidāna}—sutras written by request, or in answer to a specific questions—often involving precept breaking, \textit{itiīrttaka}—narratives, \textit{jātaka}—former lives of the Buddha, \textit{adbhuta-dharma}—
every person could understand according to their capacities. Although [the teaching] initially originated in an essential unity and realizing the fundamental meant letting go of verbal explanations, it eventually became analogous to viewing two moons (i.e., having distorted vision).\textsuperscript{105}

As a result, after Cunda’s final offering,\textsuperscript{106} on the morning when [the Tathāgata] was about to enter extinction in the Crane Grove,\textsuperscript{107} he transmitted the true Dharma-eye to Mahākāśyapa. Inwardly, he transmitted the seal of truth; outwardly, he conferred the robe of faith, creating generations of guiding teachers to serve as rightful heirs of the Buddha. After twenty-seven generations in total, [the Dharma-eye] reached the Great Master Bodhidharma. He took pity on the people of this land who were only dimly aware of the truth of mind and ceaselessly discriminated name and form, as if entering the ocean to count grains of sand. They clung to entanglements [bound by the law] of birth and death as the cause [for their practice], but this only amounted to ‘mistaking a thief for their son.’

\begin{flushend} miracles, \textit{avadāna}—parables and metaphors, \textit{upadeśa}—question and answer discourses, \textit{udāna}—impromptu or unsolicited addresses, \textit{vaipulya}—expanded sutras, and \textit{yākaraṇa}—prophecies.
\end{flushend}

\textsuperscript{105} Probably a reference to the \textit{Satyasiddhiśāstra} (\textit{Chengshi lun} 成實論), attributed to Harivarman and translated by Kumārajīva), where it mentions that pressing one’s eyes too hard can produce the vision of two moons (CBETA T 1646, 32.254a5–6). I am indebted to the anonymous reviewer for this observation.

\textsuperscript{106} Cunda was a lay disciple of Śākyamuni who invited him to his home for what turned out to be the last meal of his life. The meal is said to have been of the fruit of the sandalwood tree 旃檀耳, but there are other accounts including a stew of flesh food. The dinner was tainted, causing the Buddha to suffer from food poisoning and eventual death (as described in the \textit{Nirvāṇa-sūtra}; 翻譯名義集 T 2131.54.1062a22. [DDB]

\textsuperscript{107} The crane grove refers to the Šāla Grove, the place where Śākyamuni passed away, so named because the leaves of the trees in the Šāla Grove turned the white color of crane feathers when the Buddha died.
Then, he arrived in Cathay and practiced seated meditation at Shaolin. He did not engage in verbal explanations and did not rely on words and letters. When he found the right person [Huike], he transmitted [the Dharma to him], and then passed into tranquility and returned to truth. He was the founding patriarch in the lands of the east. From then on, the original link was transmitted from master to disciple and collateral branches appeared separately, spreading like fruit bearing flowers. It was testimony to the prophecy of [Bodhidharma’s] five petals. 108 Perpetuating the flame and dispersing the brilliance, the luminosity of a thousand lamps spread widely. With the exclusive method for escaping birth and death, one realizes nirvana. For guiding the deluded, myriad practices [are employed] according to differences among practitioners.

From the second patriarch onwards, down to the present, people with keen aptitudes in China equaled those prophesied in western lands (India). Of those who attained the Way, there were many such people indeed.109 Some of them, by clapping their hands and gazing intently, became fully cognizant of the physical changes of the phenomenal world.110 Some, by flapping their lips and wagging their tongues, became aware of the necessity of language. Some, fortunate to join together [with an enlightened master] like the needle and mustard seed,111 were quick to distinguish between gold and brass. Some

108 [Bodhidharma’s] five petals prophecy refers to his alleged prediction to the future Five Houses of Chan. A verse attributed to him in the CDL (T 51.219c) reads:
   I came to this land originally to transmit the Dharma
   And to bring deliverance from error.
   A flower opens five petals
   The fruit ripens of itself.


110 Following Ishii’s Japanese translation, p. 15.
111 An analogy that meeting a Buddha is as rare as hitting the point of a needle on earth by a mustard seed thrown from the Tuṣita Heaven (X 1911, 46: 56c22).
abandoned all the scriptures while their masters simultaneously tried to free them.\textsuperscript{112}

By the second patriarch and onward, until today, the benefits of the Han and the记得 the records. Those who obtained the way had many followers. Some, while holding the wind or speaking, immediately entered the gate of speech. Some, with a needle and a thread, argued eloquently. Some, with a chicken and a rabbit, were contemporaneously enlightened.

\textbf{II.}

Formerly there were great masters of various regions who established their own individual lineages of followers, revealing to each other transmission from master to master, frequently preserved in recorded sayings. Guishan [Zongmi] was disturbed over this state of affairs. He assimilated the various [Chan] interpretations, compiling the \textit{Collected Writings on the Source of Chan} (\textit{Chan\[yuan zhu\]quan \[ji\]}). He harmonized the various [Chan] houses to perfectly form a single flavor. The accomplishments of the patriarchs were

\textsuperscript{112} The analogy here is when a chicken hatches, it will scream in the shell to break it, which is called \textit{cui} 啄; while the hen will peck at the shell at the same time, called \textit{zhuo} 啄. It is representative of the close and harmonious relation between master and disciple, without availing of the scriptures.

\textsuperscript{113} As indicated previously, although it is possible to read this passage without inferring Chan patriarchs as the subject, since it comes at the end of a depiction of how Chan teachings arrived in China, and in the preface for a collection of records of Chan masters, this more specific reference seems to be intended.

\textsuperscript{114} As noted previously (n. 25), reading娑蝎 as a mistake for娑竭, an abbreviation of娑竭羅, a transliteration of the Sanskrit sāgara, meaning ocean, and referring to the nāga (dragon) king of the ocean palace.
recorded in full. Through the passage of time, the full *Preface* alone remains; the one hundred fascicle text is no longer in circulation.

Chan master Daoyuan of Eastern Wu is a dragon elephant (i.e., great saint), possessed of enlightened status and with the true eye of humans and deities. He lamented the lack of clarity in the proper sequence of lineage transmission after the patriarchs (i.e., after Huineng), and readily continued the legacy of the lost compilation of the thatched hut (i.e., Zongmi’s work). Thereupon, he planted his staff at the hub of the emperor’s carriage (i.e., in the capital); with the consent of the ruler and his ministers, he offered money to acquire [records] that had been lost and passed the seasons in this quest.115

From the worthy one, Mahākāśyapa, to the heirs of Fayan [Wenyi], he shook the leaves from the branches and sought the origin from ripples (i.e., he clarified the various factions in terms of their origins), even going so far as [recording] the words and phrases of their questions and answers. He exhaustively included all the opportune circumstances of their enlightenment experiences, so not even a single event escaped his notice. He diligently edited it into an anthology forming twenty fascicles.

The phrase *zaili hanshu* 載離寒暑 appears in the *Book of Songs* (*Shi jing* 詩經), “Xiaoming” 小明, translated by Legge, “I have passed through the cold and the heat,” referring to the passage of seasons, https://ctext.org/book-of-poetry/xiaoming/zh. The implication is that Daoyuan spent considerable time and effort to acquire the materials used in his compilation.
Whenever the principle [of Chan] was not expressed clearly, he added words, making them beautiful like [Zichan of] Dongli. In cases where expressions were inelegant, he employed the style of writing [Confucius used] in the *Spring and Autumn Annals* and removed them. In some cases, when only names survived and biographical details were lacking, it resembles as well the textual gaps in the *Records of the Historian*. In some cases, when songs and eulogies were simultaneously collected and added to the compilation, it is completely analogous to the numerous writings in the record of works. How great indeed, the way Chan masters employ their minds! They transmit but do not innovate!

### IV.

Alas! The Dharma realm (i.e., the universe governed by the law of cause and effect) is endless and sentient beings are unlimited. Of all those possessed of feelings, there are none who are not of the same essence. Throughout the day, they are perfectly enlightened; everything their eyes touch upon is in a state of true suchness. Yet, once they lose this marvelous insight, they are increasingly deluded. They falsely discern shadow phenomena as real and are forcibly restricted by the six fields of defilements. They accumulate causes

---

116 See the *Analects* 14.8: “The Master said, “In crafting diplomatic documents, Pi Chen drafted them, Shi Shu commented upon them, envoy Ziyu embellished them, and Zichan of Dongli made them beautiful.””

117 See the *Book of the Later Han* 40, latter part of the Biography of Ban Biao, where *zaiji* 載籍 is paired with the words of the Nine Schools of Thought and the Hundred Thinkers of the Spring and Autumn and Warring states periods. 《後漢書·卷四○·班彪傳下》：「遂博貫載籍，九流百家之言，無不窮究。」

118 *Shuer buzuo* 述而不作 is a well-known phrase in the *Analects* (Lunyu 論語) 7.1: “I transmit and do not create, trusting and cherishing the ancients. I dare compare myself to our Old Peng.”

119 The five sensory fields and the thought-field. They are the field of form 色塵, field of sound 聲塵, field of odor 香塵, gustatory field 味塵, tactile field 觸塵, and conceptual field 法塵. Mostly synonymous with 六境, except that the usage
of suffering and wander aimlessly through the three realms [of birth and death].

呜呼，法界無際，衆生無邊。凡厥有情，莫非同體。終日圓覺，觸目真如。而迷失妙明，增長虛妄。分別影事，牽制扵六塵。積集苦因，流浪扵三有。

Good and virtuous friends have sympathy for beings such as these. Not having experienced [the negative effects of] phenomenal existence, they point directly to the source. If only a single thought is not produced, the three periods of time (i.e., past, present, and future) are cut off completely, the ten directions vanish, and all the sacred ones appear before them. They are aware of the pearl [concealed] in their robe, not obtained from anyone else, like gold emerging from raw ore. How much more marvelous than this the gateway to the perfect and sudden is!

善知識愍其如是也。不歴事相，直指本源。但一念不生，即三際俱㫁，十方消殞，諸聖現前。識珠在衣，匪從他得，如金出礦。豈復重為圓頓之門，妙如此矣。

Only after examining the Way which has been realized does one know the original teachers and is born into the family of the Tathāgata, the true son of the Dharma-king. Only after investigating the principles of [Zongmi’s] Collected Writings on the Source of Chan does one understand this Anthology, and apprehend the ultimate truth, the genuine supreme vehicle. This is what one should do in the period of the decline of the Dharma: initiate mental cultivation, banish [notions of] the sacred far into the distance, unroll the scrolls [of this Anthology] to gain understanding. [By doing so], in the time it takes to snap the fingers, one will stand shoulder to shoulder with the Buddhas of the past; without rising from one’s seat, one will enter [the state of] parinirvāṇa. Even...

of the logograph 塵 indicates their defiling character, since, when the six consciousnesses apprehend their objects, the six faculties 六根 become tainted. They are also referred to as the 'external fields' 外塵 and 'six thieves' 六賊 [DDB].

120 The realms where birth and death (samsara) are experienced; desire 欲, form 色, and formlessness 無色.

121 Parinirvāṇa normally indicate the state of ultimate extinction, passing beyond the realm of birth and death and leaving the world (i.e., release from bodily existence). In this case, the inference is that Chan realization places practitioners in this state while remaining in the world, the mark of a fully realized bodhisattva.
though one has benefits such as these, one remains unattached to [the state of parinirvānic] extinction. Know this—offering gifts of the seven treasures that fill the world only supports karma producing activities; converting [members of] the two vehicles in numbers equal to the sands of the Ganges only compounds the crimes of those [Hinayanists’] with spoiled roots. As for the Dharma bestowed by the [Chan] masters, how could it be something that [rational] thought can reach? After this new *Anthology* was completed, I was asked to write a preface. I tentatively offer this general summary to introduce the compilation.

稽所證之道，然後知原師也，生如來家，真法王子。究所詮之理，然後明斯集也，了第一義，真最上乗。當使末法之年，初心之類，去聖逾逺，開巻得解。一彈指頃，齊肩古佛，不起于座，入般湼槃。雖利益之若斯，扵滅度而無取。即知，施七寳而滿剎土，徒為漏業之資，化二乗而等河沙，適重敗根之罪。師之法施，豈思議之所及哉。新集既成，咨予為序，聊摭梗槩冠于篇首云耳。
Preface to the Record of the Transmission of the Lamp compiled in the Jingde era

Composed by Yang Yi, humble servant who is Hanlin Academician, Messenger for the Grand Master for Closing Court, Remonstrator of the Left, Drafter of Imperial Pronouncements, Associate Chief Compiler of Dynastic History, Assistant to the Supervisor of the Institute of Historiography, Pillar of State, Commandery Governor of Nanyang, Founding Dynasty Marquis, Land Grant Noble of One Hundred Thousand Households, and Recipient of the Golden Seal and Purple Ribbon Fish Satchel.

I.

Formerly, Śākyamuni, upon receiving the prediction of enlightenment from Dipaṃkara, became the next Buddha of the current eon. After his descent into the world, he preached and converted for forty-nine years, revealing the methods of the expedient and true, and the sudden and gradual, and handing down the teachings of the partial and complete, the relative and all-embracing. [Sentient beings] awoke to the truth in accordance with their capacities, and herein developed the different [teachings] of the three vehicles. He provided benefits to sentient beings, and thereby rescued countless masses of them. Through his pity, he saved so many! Through his rules and rituals, he provided them with such resources!

Eventually, he entered into extinction (i.e., nirvāṇa) between the twin [sala] trees, transmitting the Dharma to Mahākāśyapa alone. The robe of authenticity was transmitted for generations, from master to disciple, down through the [first Chinese patriarch] Bodhidharma. [He taught] “do not establish words and letters, directly point to the source of the mind, do not engage in gradual methods, and attain Buddhahood at once.” After [Bodhidharma’s teaching] was transmitted

122 Yang Yi’s Jingde Chuandeng lu Preface is found at CBETA T 2076, 51: 196b–196a; Ishii, 21b–23b.
through five generations (reaching Huineng), it began to flourish; dividing into a thousand lamps, it proliferated even further. Those who arrived at the jeweled site (i.e., attained awakening) increased greatly, and those who turned the wheel of the Dharma were not limited to a single person [Śākyamuni]. In other words, the point [of the teaching] transmitted by the great hero [Śākyamuni] and the Way propagated by the true [Dharma-]eye (i.e., the Patriarchs) is “a separate practice outside the teaching” beyond rational comprehension.

II.

With the commencement of the Song dynasty, the human spirit has been quietly supported by sagely rulers.

Emperor Taizu, after quelling the chaos thorough his spiritual might, showed respect for (i.e., supported) Buddhist monasteries and opened their gates for ordinations.

Emperor Taizong, with imperial intelligence and rhetorical skill, explained the abstruse principles [of Buddhist teaching] and promoted ultimate truth.

Our current emperor [Zhenzong] furthers the will [of his predecessors] with his astute literary [sensibility]; by writing a preface for the Teachings of the Sacred Ones, he presented the teachings of our school (i.e., Buddhism). His hand-brushed calligraphy lights up [the heavens up through] the heaven of bodhisattvas who understand ultimate truth, and his golden voice shakes the

---

123 Following Ishii, reading 胸 for (日+旬).
124 Sheng jiao 聖教; a fragment of the preface is found in the Korean tripitaka, no. 1482 http://tripitaka.cbeta.org/mobile/index.php?index=K41n1482_010
125 According to DDB, yitian 義天 is one of four kinds of devas/heavenly existences 四種天: “The four classes of devas include (1) famous rulers on earth 名天 styled
garden of the enlightened. His words are in secret harmony with the lotus womb, and he successfully promotes the intentions [of the Buddha] from India. Those who plant myriad virtues steadily increase, and those who transmit a comprehensive understanding [of Buddhism] appear with great frequency. [As a result], the transformation brought about by perfect and sudden enlightenment as taught [in the Chan school] spreads throughout the districts and regions [of the land].

皇上睿文繼志，而序聖教，繹宗風。煥雲章於義天，振金聲於覺苑。蓮藏之言密契，竺乾之緒克昌。殖眾善者滋多，傳了義者間出。圓頓之化，流於區域。

III.

There is a monk from Eastern Wu, Daoyuan, who has a profound mind and delights in Chan, and seeks what is hidden in schools of thought advocating the emptiness of phenomena. He made clear the lineages of the patriarchs over successive generations and collected dialogue records from various locales. He ordered them in sequence according to their factional origins and made coherent their words and phrases. From the seven Buddhas of the past through the heirs of the great Fayan [Wenyi] there were altogether one thousand seven hundred and one individuals in fifty-two generations. It forms thirty fascicles and is titled the Record of the Transmission of the Lamp compiled in the Jingde era.

有東吳僧道原者，冥心禪悅，索隱空宗。披弈世之祖圖，采諸方之語錄。次序其源派，錯綜其辭句。由七佛以至大法眼之嗣，凡五十二世一千七百一人。成三十卷，目之曰景德傳燈錄。

IV.

I visited the imperial palace and respectfully presented a petition to circulate the work. The Emperor, as the external protector of the Buddha-dharma,

天王，天子；(2) the highest incarnations of the six paths 生天；(3) the pure, or the saints, from śrāvakas to pratyekabuddhas 淨天，and (4) all bodhisattvas above the ten stages 十住 the heaven of those who understand the ultimate truth 義天。” It is worth noting that although the reference to “sudden enlightenment” 圓頓 here is to Chan, many Chinese Buddhist texts unrelated to Chan contain the term. Overall, this passage may be construed as praising Song emperors’ general patronage of Buddhism but given the context—the fact that this praise comes in a preface to the Jingde Chuandeng lu—indicates that Yang Yi means to situate Chan as an integral part of this scenario.
rejoices in the diligent activities performed by Buddhists. Bearing within him such deep care, he hoped that [the contents of the work] be conveyed into the distant future. As a result, he decreed that his humble servant, the Hanlin Academician, Remonstrator of the Left, and Drafter of Imperial Pronouncements, Yang Yi; his humble servant, the Vice Director of the Ministry of War and Drafter of Imperial Pronouncements, Li Wei; and his humble servant, the Assistant to the Chamberlain for Ceremonials, Wang Shu; and others, work together to enhance [the good prose] and amend or eliminate [the bad prose], to make it of acceptable standard. We humble servants are not proficient in the three aspects of Buddhism and are confused about the tendencies of the five natures toward achieving Buddhahood. We lack ability in the interpretive skills of a [Xie Lingyin] of Linchuan, and were

127 The three bases of Buddhist learning and practice: šīla, samādhi, and prajñā.

128 DDB provides a convenient summary of the theory of the Yogācāra school that teaches the discrimination of the innate capacities of temperaments of sentient beings into five types

1. the nature predetermined for śrāvaka practices; sentient beings in this group will ultimately attain the state of arhat.

2. The nature predetermined for pratyekabuddha practices; these people will also attain to the level of arhat. The first two are commonly taken together as those with 'two-vehicle proclivities' 定性二乘.

3. the nature predetermined for bodhisattva; whose members will ultimately attain the full enlightenment of the buddhas.

4. the indeterminate nature, whose members inherently possess the potential to attain the goals of two or three of the groups above. In practice a member of this group may first become an arhat and then become a Mahāyāna bodhisattva.

5. the nature lacking capacity for enlightenment (一闡提 icchantika). The group of sentient beings who lack any type of untainted seeds, and therefore have no prospect of attaining either lesser or greater vehicle enlightenment. They are doomed to pass through the cycle of birth and death for all eternity.

http://www.buddhism-dict.net/cgi-bin/xpr-ddb.pl?4e.xml+id(%27b4e94-6027-5404-5225%27)

This theory was the focus of much contentious debate in East Asia, wherein the Faxiang school and its other East Asian derivatives was criticized by scholars of Tiantai and Huayan background.

129 Xie Lingyun (385–433) was one of the foremost Chinese poets of the Southern and Northern Dynasties and a famous practitioner of Six Dynasties poetry. His father died when he was young and Xie Lingyun was brought up by a Buddhist monk, Du Ming, in Qiantang (Hangzhou). Xie retained a lifelong Buddhist practice.
ignorant of the point of [Vimalakīrti’s] silence in the city of Vaiśali.130

We respectfully received the august order, daring not to refuse it under any circumstances.131 We furtively applied our efforts to investigate the text, without recourse to relaxation or stopping to rest. Our intention in examining the compilation was to fully take true emptiness as fundamental to it, to relate the circumstances that caused former sacred ones to enter the Way and provide explanations on how people in the past tacitly accorded with [Chan] principle.132 With the advantageous opportunities and intense interactions [that the examples of former sacred ones and people of the past provide], like the prodding of an arrow tip, the repository of wisdom [inherent in one] radiates forth, assisted by the shadow of a whip.133 It entices later students of the Way to propagate freely the pathway to the profound.

130 A reference to Vimalakīrti’s silence where the inconceivable is most fully elaborated in the famous climactic scene in the Vimalakīrti sūtra. When Vimalakīrti suggests that the assembled bodhisattvas tell about their own entry into full awareness of the reality of nonduality, thirty-one bodhisattvas discuss the multifaceted aspects of nonduality, introducing such dualities as good and bad, sacred and profane, and birth and death, taking for granted their presumed reality in our conventional lives. Vimalakīrti’s nondual awareness is introduced as the antidote to our sense of estrangement and suffering, and our fragmented lives owing to these unquestioned habits of dualistic discrimination. Vimalakīrti’s silence serves as a prime example of the Chan fullness of expression and communication that simultaneously demonstrates the limitations of language, a silence that is dynamically expressive and illuminating performance art.

131 The compound laorang 牢讓 appears in the Han shu 漢書 86, “Shi Dan zhuan” 師丹傳, in the phrase laorang juewei 牢讓爵位 (obstinately declining a title) http://www.guoxuedashi.com/a/31b/111224y.html. It literally means to “refuse obstinately,” but the sense here is that there is no way the order of the emperor could be declined.

132 Li 理 is normally translated as “principle,” but it’s possible meanings also include “truth, reality; coherence,” and “original truth or universal principle.” [Charles Muller, DDB]

133 An analogy for a person with keen faculties, based on a simile from the Samyuktāgama. The simile speaks of four kinds of horses, those that respond merely by seeing the shadow of the whip, by being pricked lightly by the whip, by receiving a good whack, and by having its flesh pierced to the bone. The first horse is
恭承嚴命，不敢牢讓。竊用探索，匪遑寧居。考其論譔之意，蓋以真空為本，將以述曩聖入道之因，標昔人契理之說。機緣交激，若拄於箭鋒，智藏發光，旁資於鞭影。誘道後學，敷暢玄猷。

However, after gathering and arranging the contents and examining the material selected, it frequently contained rubbish, and the rich essence needed to be retrieved. In this regard, the great being [Śākyamuni] revealed [the message] to his followers; he preached a uniform message, and beings possessing spirit were stirred to listen. Subsequently, a thousand sacred ones authenticated [his message]. What the work included is generally recommended to be of value, and even taking up small portions of it are beneficial. To enhance it further by adding embellishments misses the point of the message. The issue is not so much the differences between Chinese and Indian languages as the harm done to a precious stone through poor cutting. Examples such as these have all been left as they were in the Old Record. Moreover, the documentation of actual events surely depends on skillful narration [to be effective]. For words to travel far [and be transmitted to future generations], they cannot lack literary elegance (wen).

而捃摭之來，徵引所出，糟粕多在，油素可尋。其有大士示徒，以一音而開演，含靈聳聽。乃千聖之證明。屬概舉之是資，取少分而斯可。若乃別加潤色，失其指歸。既非華竺之殊言，頗近錯雕之傷寶。如此之類，悉仍其舊。況又事資紀實，必由於善敘。言以行遠，非可以無文。

In this regard, in recording the circumstances of events and relating in detail the traces of the course taken, the [Old] Record in some cases ordered the words compared to one who realizes the truth of suffering and ill and acts accordingly by only hearing of the suffering of others, the second upon actually seeing the suffering or death of others, the third by seeing the suffering or death of relatives, and the fourth by one’s own physical suffering [Swanson, DDB].

As noted above, this is a paraphrase of a line attributed to Confucius in the Zuo [zhuan 左傳]. As cited in Ouyang Xiu’s Wenzhong ji 文忠集 68 in Jushi waiji 居士外集 18 it reads, with commentary: “言之無文，行而不遠。”君子之所學也。言以載事，而文以飾言，事信言文，乃能表見於後世。The Zuo zhuan says: “Words that are not written down do not travel far” is [a phrase] that is learned by the Junzi. When recording matters that have been spoken in writing, the written text is used to embellish what was spoken, and the matters are faithfully conveyed in word and text. As a result, [the Junzi] is able to express them clearly to later generation.” https://ctext.org/wiki.pl?if=gb&chapter=83792 (3).
confusingly and in some cases used coarse language—all of this we deliberately removed in order to make it of imperial quality. And when it comes to dialogues with Confucian officials and lay gentleman, or those who are noteworthy for their ranks of nobility or family name, we checked their dates for errors and consulted historical records for inaccuracies, eliminating all of them in order to make what [the dialogues] transmit trustworthy.

其有標錄事緣，纏詳軌迹，或辭條之紛糾，或言筌之猥俗，並從刊削，俾之綸貫。至有儒臣居士之問答，爵位姓氏之著明，校歲歷以愆殊，約史籍而差謬，咸用刪去，以資傳信。

If it did not instinctively launch a penetrating needle to the mysterious destination, hasten an early opportunity for sudden lightning (i.e., enlightenment), reveal the miraculously brilliant true mind, and explain the profound principle of our predecessors regarding the emptiness of suffering, how would it tacitly agree with the metaphor of transmitting the lamp and produce the effect of eliminating the film that blinds the eyes? If it were only for providing proof of sympathetic resonance between enlightened beings and practitioners, or simply to reveal the tracks of their dedicated wanderings [in search of truth], this has already been recorded in the Histories of [Eminent] Monks, not to mention what was taken up in the Collected Writings on the Source of Chan (Chan[yuan zhu]quan [ji]). Although the title alone remains for the world’s descendants, what the master [Zongmi] respectfully submitted recorded [these details] in full.

自非啟投針之玄趣，馳激電之迅機，開示妙明之真心，祖述苦空之深理，即何以契傳燈之喻，施刮膜之功。若乃但述感應之徵符，專敘參遊之轍迹，此已標於僧史，亦奚取於禪詮。聊存世系之名，庶紀師承之自。

Nonetheless, what was recorded in the Old Record sometimes adopted vulgar expressions and omitted refined ones. Depending on surviving materials contained in separate collections, we proceeded to investigate the contents of these texts to restore deficiencies. We succeeded in selecting [appropriate enhancements] to supplement it, and as a result, what we added was beneficial to the work as a whole. When it comes to the composition of the preface, in cases where [the text] was not in the literary style of the former virtuous ones, we inquired into the adulterated nature of the composition, or when it annoyingly increased the verbosity (the two words xuan-niang appear in the Collected Works of Duke Zhang Yan in the Tang dynasty, meaning long and
tedious), we also opted for succinctness and eliminated many passages. After the course of nearly a full year, we succeeded in finishing the editing.

然而舊錄所載，或掇粗而遺精。別集具存，當尋文而補闕。率加采摭，爰從附益。逮於序論之作，或非古德之文，問廂編聯，徒增楦釀（楦釀二字出唐張燕公文集。謂冗長也），亦用簡別，多所屏去。汔茲周歲，方遂終篇。

V.

Your humble servants are ashamed by the dark afflictions in our perception, and embarrassed by the cursory knowledge gained in our education. Our natural abilities are simple and shallow, and our literary powers unremarkable. The wondrous Way exists within us, always abiding even as we purify our minds. Profound words sever our worldly existence, abundantly abiding as we resolutely face the wall [like Bodhidharma in meditation]. While randomly receiving promotions, we have not proven effective in spreading Buddhist teachings. We have succeeded in finishing the thread (i.e., editing the text), and reverently offer it to His Majesty [to peruse] at his leisure. [We fear] it will be of no assistance for His Majesty’s understanding and will unnecessarily cloud His Majesty’s astute vision. Respectfully submitted.

臣等性識媿於冥煩，學問慚於涉獵。天機素淺，文力無餘。妙道在人，雖刳心而斯久。玄言絕俗，固牆面以居多。濫膺推擇之私，靡著發揮之功。已克終於紬繹，將仰奉於清間。莫副宸襟，空塵睿覽。謹上。

135 The Collected Works of Duke Zhang Yan 張燕公集 in 25 fascicles is located in Qinding Siku quanshu, (Zhejiang University Library edition: https://ctext.org/wiki.pl?if=gb&res=606643). I have been unable to find a reference to xuan-niang there. Duke Zhang Yan, or Duke Wenzhen of Yan 燕文貞公, is the title granted Zhang Yue 張說 (663–730), a prominent literary figure and leading official in the Tang dynasty, who served as chancellor (zaixiang 宰相) during the reigns of Emperors Ruizong and Xuanzong. Along with Su Ting 蘇頲 (680–737), Zhang Yue was regarded as the two great literary figures of the Kaiyuan era (713–756).

136 Referring to the editors of the Jingde Chuandeng lu, Yang Yi, Li Wei, and Wang Shu, etc.

137 Xingshi 性識 refers to natural powers of perception, or the knowledge acquired through the sense organs; see 大智度論 (X 1509, 25: 427b23).
Entry on Yang Yi in Tiansheng Guangdeng lu 18
(Expanded Lamp Record compiled in the Tiansheng era)\textsuperscript{138}

Hanlin Academy Scholar, Vice Director in the Ministry of Public Works,\textsuperscript{139}
Head Director of the Ministry of Rites, Master of Literature, Yang Yi.

I. Letter to Li Wei

As Assistant Secretary-Supervisor and Director of Ruzhou, he (Yang Yi) sent a letter to Li Wei at the Hanlin Academy. It accounts in detail his influences from [Chan] masters. The letter stated:

Even as a young ignorant fool, I appreciated and cared for [things that mattered]. Once I heard the message of the Southern School, I made the long sojourn to the capital. Between movement and stillness,\textsuperscript{140} I sought out advice. Through my consultations with others, I was urged on. It enabled me to reach out with an open heart,\textsuperscript{141} and as one unashamed to face the wall [like Bodhidharma],\textsuperscript{142} I sincerely went out [to practice] among the straw mats and beneath the raised platforms [in the mediation hall]. I am truly indebted to you for this, and even more to my great teacher, Master An, who regularly imparted to me instruction and guidance. Following the one who entered nirvāṇa under the pair of sala trees, and the single-sandaled one who returned to the western regions, [Master An passed away]. I was overwhelmed with grief and had no one with whom to stay [to continue my practice]. I passed the year plagued with a long illness, my spirit depressed, confused and disappointed. Nevertheless, as my condition began to improve, I once again understood the course I needed to take. Then Master Liang of Mt. Yunmen,\textsuperscript{143} a great being, deigned to look after a common rustic [like myself]. The message of Master Liang was exactly the same as Master An’s. Moreover, he had come from the Guizong [Monastery] on Mt. Lu and from Mt. Yunju.\textsuperscript{144} Both were disciples of Fayan [Wenyi].

\textsuperscript{138} X 1553, 78: 511c4–512c17.
\textsuperscript{139} Hucker no. 5278.
\textsuperscript{140} On the phrase \textit{dongjing} 動靜 (literally “movement and stillness”), see n. 66.
\textsuperscript{141} On the phrase \textit{kuxin} 剖心 (to open the mind/heart), see n. 67.
\textsuperscript{142} On \textit{qiangmian} 牆面 (face the wall), see n. 68.
\textsuperscript{143} On Mt. Yunmen, see n. 69.
\textsuperscript{144} On Guizong Monastery 歸宗寺, see n. 70.
任秘書監。知汝州日。曾有書寄李維內翰。敘其始末師承。書云。

病夫夙以頑憃，獲受獎顧。預聞南宗之旨，久陪上國之游。動靜咨詢。周旋策發。俾其刳心之有，詣牆面之無。慙者誠出於席間牀下矣。矧又故安公大師每垂誘導。自雙林滅影，隻履西歸。中心浩然。罔知所止。仍歲沉痼，神慮迷恍。殆及小間，再辨方位。又得雲門諒公大士見顧蒿蓬。諒之旨趣，正與安公同轍。並自廬山歸宗，雲居而來。皆是法眼之流裔。

Last year, when I was appointed Acting Prefect of this prefecture (Ruzhou, in Henan province), I met the senior Chan monk Guanghui [Yuanlian]. In fact, Yuanlian is the successor of Nanyuan [Xing]nian; [Xing]nian succeeded Fengxue [Yanzhao]; Fengxue succeeded Nanyuan [Huiyong]; Nanyuan succeeded Xinghua [Cunjiang]; Xinghua succeeded Linji [Yixuan]; Linji succeeded Huangbo [Xiyun]; Huangbo succeeded Baizhang [Huaihai]; Huaihai succeeded Mazu [Daoyi]; Mazu succeeded Venerable Rang [Nanye Huairang]; [Venerable] Rang was the eldest heir of Caoxi [Huineng]. After I performed the simple tasks of the prefecture office, I returned home with ample leisure at my disposal. Sometimes I welcomed Yuanlian to my home; sometimes I ordered a carriage to go to his place. I invited him [to my home] and visited [his residence] without restraint, and my accumulated encumbrances suddenly began to dissipate. After half a year I was completely free of all doubts. It was as if I suddenly remembered what had been forgotten, like abruptly awakening from sleep. Past concerns which I had been attached to I discarded at once, without so much as a thought. Matters that I had failed to understand for many years appeared distinctly before my eyes. Indeed, how much more decisive were my judgements, and I dealt with matters without any hesitation whatsoever.

去年假守茲郡，適會廣惠禪伯。實承嗣南院念，念嗣風穴，風穴嗣先南院，南院嗣興化，興化嗣臨濟，臨濟嗣黃檗，黃檗嗣先百丈海，海嗣馬祖，馬祖出讓和尚，讓即曹谿之長嫡也。齋中務簡，退食多暇。或坐邀而至，或命駕從之。請叩無方，蒙滯頓釋。半歲之後，曠然弗疑。如忘忽記，如睡忽覺。平昔礙膺之物，嚯然自落。積劫未明之事，曜爾現前。固亦決擇之洞分，應接之無蹇矣。

I repeatedly recalled how virtuous predecessors made frequent visits [to Masters] in their search for [awakening]. For example, Xuefeng visited Dongshan nine times, and Touzi three times, before finally succeeding Deshan. Linji obtained the Dharma from Dayu, but in the end succeeded Huangbo. While Yungan often received instruction from Daowu, he became the heir of Yaoshan.
While Danxia personally received certification from Mazu, he still became the heir of Shitou. In the past [examples like this] frequently occurred; in principle there is nothing disagreeable about it. I, a sick fellow, currently continue my affinity with Guanghui, and it has propelled me to success at Aofeng (i.e., the Hanlin Academy). What good fortune!

重念先德率多參尋。如雪峯九度上洞山，三度上投子，遂嗣德山。臨濟得法於大愚，終承黃檗。雲巖多蒙道吾訓誘，乃為藥山之子。丹霞親承馬祖印可，而作石頭之裔。在古多有，於理無嫌。病夫今繼紹之緣，實屬於廣惠，而提激之自，良出於鼇峯也。忻幸，忻幸。

II. Dialogues

The Vice Director asked Venerable Guanghui: “Words attributed to you, venerable master, claim that all sins are born of wealth and riches. You [therefore] encourage people to avoid wealth and profit. But [we] beings in Jambudvipa take wealth as our livelihood; the nation uses wealth in order to bring people together; and the [Buddhist] teachings have the ‘two gifts of wealth and Dharma.’ How could you encourage people to avoid wealth?”

Guang[hui] replied: “The iron dragon-head on the tip of the banner pole.”

The Vice Director said: “The horses in Haitan are like donkeys and dogs."

Guang[hui]: “A Chu chicken is not the Phoenix of Cinnabar Mountain.”

Vice Director: “Buddha has been dead for two-thousand years. Bhikṣus show little remorse.”

---

145 I am grateful to the reviewers of this translation who pointed out errors in the GDL text here. First of all, the punctuation in GDL: 一切罪業皆因賊寶所生 should omit the stop after 罪業 to read as 一切罪業皆因賊寶所生。More importantly, kunzei 困賊 should be read as yincai 困財. These changes are validated by the copy of Yang Yi’s preface included in CDL 30 (T 2076, 51:464b22). The wealth of the two gifts, ‘wealth and Dharma,’ refers to the material support provided by lay donors to the monastic community, including money, food, clothes, and material assets and commodities of all kinds.

146 Haitian, also called Pingtan 平潭, is an island of the coast of Fujian.

147 According to the Classic of Mountain and Sea, a mountain located five hundred li to the east that produces red water that flows southward into the Bohai Sea, where the Phoenix lives.
侍郎問廣惠和尚。「尋常承和尚有言，一切罪業皆因財寶所生。勸人疎於財利。況南閻眾生以財為命。邦國以財聚人，教中有財法二施。何得勸人疎財。」廣云。「幡竿尖上鐵龍頭。」侍云。「海壇馬子似驢犬。」廣云。「楚雞不是丹山鳳。」侍云。「佛滅二千歲。比丘少慚愧。」

[The Vice Director] asked: “Monk Biaocheng, I have heard a saying from the past that there is no Maitreya either in heaven or here on earth. Where is Maitreya?”

[Biao]cheng replied: “Wood in the hand.”

Vice Director: “[Maitreya] is where our sins return.”

[Biao]cheng: “It’s difficult to find someone who recognizes his faults.”

Vice Director: “Take my staff” (apparently thrusting it at Biaocheng).

[Biao]cheng railed at the Vice Director: “How can I let you get away with that!”

問。「門僧表澄，承古有言，天上無彌勒，地上無彌勒。未審彌勒在什麼處。」澄云。「手上木。」侍云。「罪有所歸。」澄云。「知過人難得。」侍云。「喫取拄杖。」澄喝侍云。「且放過即不可。」

The Vice Director asked the emperor’s son-in-law Li [Zunxu]: “Śākyamuni practiced austerities for six years. What did he accomplish?”

The Commandant replied: “One knows the weight of firewood by shouldering it.”

侍郎問李駙馬。「釋迦六年苦行，成得甚麼事。」尉云。「擔折知柴重。」

[The Vice Director] asked: “How does a blind person lead the blind masses?”

The Commandant replied: “Blindly.”

Vice Director: “That’s obvious.”

The Commandant promptly retired.

問。「一盲引眾盲時如何。」尉云。「盲。」侍云。「灼然。」尉便休。

---

148 Reading 郎 for 即.
149 Reading yincai 因財 for kunzei 困賊, as in CDL 30 (T 2076, 51:464b22).
[Later Tang] Emperor Tongguang (r. 923–926) asked Venerable Xinghua: “I have inherited the treasure of the Central Plain but there isn’t anyone to buy it off me at a price corresponding to its value.”

Xinghua said: “May I see Your Majesty’s treasure for a moment?” The emperor used his hand to unroll his turban [and reveal the treasure].

Xinghua [then] said: “Your Lordship’s treasure—who would dare buy it from you?”

Xuanjue commented: “What is your point, Xinghua? If you don’t approve [of the emperor], where was [the emperor’s understanding] at fault?”

The Vice Director commented: “When Xinghua responded in this way, was he approving of Zhuangzong or was he disapproving of Zhuangzong? Try analyzing [the case] for yourself and see.”

同光帝問興化和尚云。「朕收得中原之寶，秖是無人酬價。」
興化云。「略借陛下寶看。」帝以手舒幞頭腳。
興化云。「君王之寶，誰敢酬價。」
玄覺云。「秖如興化眼在什麼處。若不肯，過在什麼處。」
侍云。「興化恁麼秖對，是肯莊宗，不肯莊宗。試辨看。」

III. 論話 Discourses

When speaking about the Way with Buddhist monks, the Vice Director said:

The Way is not separate from people; it is people who are able to make the Way known. In general, people who practice and study [Chan] must be attentive throughout the twelve periods of the day. Have you not seen where Nanquan [Puyuan] says he looked after a water buffalo for thirty

---

150 The Later Tang (923–937) was a short-lived imperial dynasty during the Five Dynasties and Ten Kingdoms period. The first three of Later Tang’s four emperors, including Tongguang, were ethnically sinicized Shatuo. The name Tang was used to legitimate itself as the restorer of the Tang dynasty (618–907). Although Later Tang officially began in 923, the dynasty already existed in the years before, as a polity called Jin (907–923). Tongguang was killed in an officer’s rebellion in 926.

151 Xuanjue is likely a reference to Dongchan Xuanliang 東禪玄亮 (a.k.a. Xuanjue 玄覺), a disciple of Xuansha Shibei’s 玄沙師備 descendant, Bailong Daoxi 白龍道希. He appears as a commentator in Xuansha shibei chanshi yulu 玄沙師備禪師語錄, fascicles 2 (4 comments) & 3 (2 comments), X 144,6,73:32c–42b.
years? When it encroached into neighboring crops he pulled it by its nose back to its proper place. Thereupon, it became a white ox in the open air, naked. He did not let it go. All of you should show some sparkle and glitz. You can’t have a principle of the Way that thwarts how you show yourself when you explain the Way of Chan. You can’t not be present when you are engaged in the task of picking vegetables. It is like a chicken nursing an egg. If it forsakes and abandons it, the warmth provided by incubation will not be provided and the chick will not be born. Today, the myriad objects of existence

152 Nanquan Puyuan’s record is contained in CDL 8 (CBETA T 2076, 51: 257b18–259b4); the reference to a water buffalo appears toward the end. Earlier, it claims he did not leave Nanquan Monastery in Chiyang 池陽 for over thirty years.

The Head Monk asked: “Master, where will you be a hundred years from now?” Master [Nanquan] replied: “I will be a water buffalo at the foot of the mountain.” Monk: “Will it be okay for me to follow you there, Master?” Master: “If you follow me, you must arrive chewing on a stalk of grass.”

153 See the Introduction to Case #94 in the Blue Cliff Record, “Not Seeing” (CBETA X 2003, 48: 217b9–12):

The one statement prior to sound is not transmitted by the thousand sages; the single thread in front of our eyes is forever without a gap. Pure and naked, bare and clean, a white ox in the open air. Eyes alert, ears alert, the golden lion—leaving this aside for the moment, tell me, what is a white ox in the open air?

聲前一句。千聖不傳。面前一絲。長時無間。淨裸裸赤灑灑。露地白牛。眼卓朔耳卓朔。金毛獅子。則且置。且道。作麼生是露地白牛。

[Thomas Cleary, trans., The Blue Cliff Record, 410 (with minor changes)].

154 As a reviewer noted, the passage cited by Yang Yi here more accurately reflects a passage concerning Da’an 大安 (Fuzhou Xiyuan 福州西院), the disciple of Baizhang 百丈, recorded in ZTJ 17 and CDL 9, which are essentially the same in both versions, with slight variation. The ZTJ (B 144, 25:614a–b):

Therefore, he lived comfortably on Mt. Gui for thirty years, eating the food of Mt. Gui and depositing feces on Mt. Gui. He did not study Chan on Mt. Gui, and only looked after a water buffalo. When he lost his way and [the buffalo] wandered out into the grass and encroached upon neighboring crops, he whipped and beat it. After taming and subduing the poor creature, he was told by someone: “Right now, become the white ox in open air, always existing permanently right in front of you, always apparent everywhere. Cherish it and do not let it go.”

所以安在溈山，三十年來，喫溈山飯，痾溈山屎。不學溈山禪，只是長看一頭水牯牛。落路入草便牽出，侵犯人苗稼則鞭打。調來伏去，可憐生，受人言語。「如今一時變作個露地白牛，常在在面前，終日露迥迥地，趁亦不肯去。」

155 The meaning of zhaodai 照帶 is uncertain, and the translation tentative.
are all interconnected, but the troublesome vexations of the six senses deprive you of the opportunity to see them clearly, exposing your body and life [to danger]. This is no small matter. The causal conditions (i.e., karma) that have brought you here are shackled by birth and death (i.e., samsara). After the passage of countless eons, according to the rising and cessation of mental activity and following the flow of your transformations, you have arrived at your present circumstance. You all, tell me, if you’re already dead and gone, how have you arrived at your present circumstance? You must recognize the white ox in the open air! Try grabbing [the ox] by the nostrils, pulling it back, and see [for yourself]!

The Vice Director said:

Venerable Xuansha said: “In the Great Country of Tang, there has never been anyone in the [Chan] school that [truly] proclaimed the Dharma (i.e., announced their own personal style of teaching). If someone were to [truly] proclaim the Dharma, everyone in the whole world would have been knocked dead by it. It is like an iron hammer with no hole [for a handle].\textsuperscript{156} As soon as [people heard the Dharma truly proclaimed], they’d miss the point and their tongues would be tied.” So tell me, what’s the meaning of this? Nowadays, when [Chan masters] provisionally set up [notions of] “guest and host,” they move their lips,\textsuperscript{157} raise their fingers, and pick up their fly whisks, it just amounts

\textsuperscript{156} A Chan metaphor for how the ultimate state cannot be reached through ordinary concepts and thinking.

\textsuperscript{157} The Linji lu conveys similar sentiments: “Bah! Carrying that body and mind of yours, you go around everywhere flapping your lips like winnowing fans and deceiving villagers.” 咄哉，爾將這箇身心，到處簸兩片皮，訛謬閑閭。（Sasaki trans., Kirchner, The Record of Linji, 284).
to upside-down views, enabling your crazy ideas, and teaching you to seek opportunities to ask questions. If you’re facing someone who is clear-eyed (a real Chan master), how will you seize the opportunity?158

It is just like when a [Chan master] Lüzu saw a monk coming,159 he would face a wall. Nanquan said:160 “Treating people (i.e., students) in this way—only in the year of the donkey (i.e., never) will you get one!” I say Lüzu is completely shameless. How could a “clear-eyed person” permit such treatment? These days you have no alternative [than these sham Chan masters], leading all of you to form upside down views, like shaping a napkin into a horse [and then thinking the horse is real] or grasping for flowers [in the sky that are an optical illusion].161

Each of the former patriarchs spoke to reveal the Buddha’s wisdom and insight, to express the Buddha’s wisdom and insight, to awaken to the Buddha’s wisdom and insight, to enter into the Buddha’s wisdom and insight. When they teach in this way, how they diminish its prestige! So, tell me—what are you lacking in your capacity [to pursue real awakening]?162 Although this is the case, if I did not inform you of this

---

158 Similar phrasings are found in CDL 18, in the record of Xuansha (T 2076, 51:346a14–17), suggesting the entire passage may be read as Xuansha’s words, and that Yang Yi is working from a different collection.

159 Lüzu refers to Chan master Baoyun of Mt. Lüzu 魯祖山寶雲禪師, a disciple of Mazu Daoyi. Both ZTJ 14 (B 144, 25:574b6–575a2) and CDL 7 (T 2076, 51:251c21–252a1) contain versions of the episode recounted here.

160 Although Yang Yi’s preface has this as Changqing 長慶 rather than Nanquan 南泉, it is clear from the ZTJ and CDL entries (see previous note) that the latter is intended.

161 Literally, “pressing the eyes to produce flowers.” Compare with a passage in the Śūraṅgama-sūtra (Shou lengyan jing 首楞嚴經): “It is similar to pressing the eyes to produce imaginary flowers” 猶如揑目。亂花發生。（T 945, 19:141b23). Konghua 空華 (flowers in the sky) is a common Buddhist metaphor, as explained in DDB: “Illusory flowers seen in the sky as the result of an optical disorder; spots before the eyes, muscae volitantes; illusion. A metaphor used in a broad range of philosophical works, including translations from Yogācāra and Tathāgatagarbha works, as well as in East Asian texts such as the Awakening of Faith, Śūraṅgama-sūtra and Sutra of Perfect Enlightenment, to show the nature of discriminated ignorance.”

162 Fen 分 is used to mean benfen 本分, referring to individuals’ innate abilities or capacities. Chan Buddhists often use fenshang 分上 in this way (see Iriya and Koga, Zengo jiten, 410b).
in such a way, how would you be able to see me?\textsuperscript{163} The ancients say there are few who know their own thoughts. How many have had the pleasure of benefitting from what had been said before [by the ancients]? If you are unclear about this, go ask an open-air pillar!\textsuperscript{164}

侍郎云。「玄沙和尚道。『大唐國內。宗門中事。未曾有人舉唱。或有人舉唱。盡大地人總失却性命。如無孔鐵槌\textsuperscript{165}相似。一時亡鋒結舌去。』且道是甚道理。如今假立箇賓主,動者兩片皮,豎起指頭,拈起拂子,總成顛倒知見,順汝狂意,教汝有箇申問處。若是明眼人前,恁生拈掇得出。祗如魯\textsuperscript{166}祖和尚見僧來便面壁。南泉\textsuperscript{168}道。「怎地地接人,驢年得一箇去。」我道魯\textsuperscript{169}祖也祗是不識羞。是他明眼人又爭肯。儞今來事不獲已,與汝諸人作顛倒知見,一似結巾為馬,揑目生華。上祖道箇開佛知見,示佛知見,悟佛知見,入佛知見。教地恁道,抑下多少威光。且道諸人分上欠少箇什麼。雖然如此,我若不恁麼與汝知聞,儞又什麼處得見我。古人道,知思者少。上道承箇甚人恩。於此不明,問取露柱去。」

\textsuperscript{163} The wording here closely paraphrases the closing line of a sermon by Xuansha: “If I did not make it known to you, how would you manage to be able to see me?” I 若不共汝恁麼有聞去,汝向什麼處得見我? (X 1446, 73:32a15–b7).

\textsuperscript{164} According to DDB, the “open-air pillar” is: “A pillar standing by itself without being joined to a wall. The dharma halls and buddha halls at many Zen monasteries in Japan are built using a traditional Chinese style of post-and-beam construction. The spaces 間 between the posts—round wood pillars—that are on the perimeter of the building are filled by walls (with or without windows in them) or doors, but the round ‘pillars’ 柱 that stand in the interior of the building are ‘bare’ 露 in the sense that they are entirely exposed all the way around.”

While the intention of the reference here is obscure, the phrase “go ask an open-air pillar” appears frequently in Chan texts as a non-sequitur, a phrase intended to cut off normal, rational discourse. An example is the attribution to Shitou in ZTJ 4: “A monk asked, “What is the meaning of the patriarch coming from the west?” Master [Shitou] said, “Go ask an open-air pillar.” The monk said, “I don’t understand.” Master [Shitou] said: “Nor do I.” 僧問：「如何是祖師西來意？」師曰：「問取露柱去。」僧曰：「不會。」師曰：「我更不會。」 (B 144, 25:374b12–14).

\textsuperscript{165} Replacing the GDL phrase: 垂孔鐵錘 with the phrase in Xuansha’s entry in the CDL: 如無孔鐵槌 (see T 2076, 51:346a12–14), “an iron hammer with no hole [for a handle].”

\textsuperscript{166} Reading恁生 as equivalent to 怎生. Nensheng 恽生 appears to be an exclusive usage of the GDL, where other Chan texts commonly use zensheng 怎生.

\textsuperscript{167} Reading lü 魯 for zeng 曾.

\textsuperscript{168} Reading Nanquan 南泉 for Changqing 長慶.

\textsuperscript{169} Reading lü 魯 for zeng 曾.
The Vice Director said:

This matter is extremely difficult. Śākyamuni, the old boy, mulled it over for three periods of seven (twenty-one) days before deciding to enter nirvana. He received three solicitous requests from Indra and Brahma, and had no choice but to agree to it. Beginning from the Deer Park, ending at Kuśinagara, for forty-nine years in between, he performed the great work of the Buddha. He preached the five vehicles and twelve parts of the teaching like water pouring from a jug. Afterwards, at the assembly on Vulture Peak, he laid his eyes on [Mahā]kāśyapa and told the great assembly: “I bequeath my dharma-eye of the king on Mahā the Great Kāśyapa.” He also said: “In the forty-nine years I have not preached a single word.” What does this mean? If you have the capacity for it, you won’t be attached to a single word. Each and every one of you has something special within you, but as soon as you refer to it as special, you miss the mark. I tell you, Śākyamuni is the general of a defeated army, Kāśyapa is a person who fears for his body and losing his life. All of you, how do you understand this? Have you not heard it said, “Nirvana and birth and death (samsara) are both just words uttered in dreams? The Buddha and sentient beings are both tentative designations.” You absolutely must understand

---

170 Buddhist visual culture often depicts this scene, such as the stone-carving in the possession of the Art Institute of Chicago, entitled “Buddha Worshipped by the gods Indra and Brahman.”

171 Similar to a passage attributed to an ancient one 古人 in ZTJ 15, in the record of Baoji 寶積, a disciple of Mazu Daoyi: “The spiritual source alone shines, the Way is originally unborn. Great wisdom does not clarify, true emptiness leaves no marks. Thusness, ordinary folk and sages, all are words uttered in dreams. Buddha and nirvana are both tentative designations. Chan monks, you must see for yourselves. No one else will do it for you. The three realms are non-existent. Where will you seek mind? The four elements (earth, water, fire, and wind) are fundamentally empty. How can Buddha be based on them? Whirling instruments are motionless. Tranquility has no basis. Face up to it as it presents itself. There is nothing else than this.” 所以古人道：『靈源獨耀，道本無生。大智非明，真空絕跡。真如凡聖，皆是夢言。佛及涅槃，並為增語，禪德切須自看，無人替代。三界無法，何處求心？四大本空，佛依何住？旋機不動，寂爾無根，覿面相呈，更無餘事。』
like this. You must not rush around seeking outwardly. If you’re not yet clear about this, I dare say that your mistakes are not few.

侍云。「此事大難。釋迦老子三七日中思惟，便欲入涅槃。被帝釋梵王，懇懇三請，不得已而許之。始自鹿苑，終於俱尸羅城，中間四十九年大作佛事。說五乘十二分教，如缾注水。後來於靈山會上目視迦葉，謂大眾云。「吾王法眼已付麼訶大迦葉。』又云。「我於四十九年中，不曾說一字。」此是什麼道理。若於諸人分上，著一字脚不得。為諸人各各有奇特事在，喚作奇特，早是不中也。我道釋迦是敗軍之將，迦葉是畏身失命底人。汝等諸人且怎生會。不見道。「涅槃生死俱夢言。佛與眾生並為增語。」直須恁麼會取。不要向外馳求。若也於此未明，敢道乖張不少。」

The Vice Director raised [the statement of] the Zhao lun ( Treatises of Sengzhao):

“It is only the sage who understands that the myriad things are oneself!” At present, are the mountains and rivers, the ground, trees and human possessions that appear on the earth the same or are they different? If you say they are the same, isn’t every single thing different from each other? If you say they are different, didn’t the ancient one [Sengzhao] speak of “understanding that the myriad things are oneself”? So, how do we understand this? It is just as the teaching says, “If someone realizes the truth and returns to the origin, empty space in all ten directions at once dissolves.” An ancient virtuous one also stated: “If one understands [the true nature of] mind, the great earth does not have even an inch of soil.” What does this mean? Your singular eye (i.e., eye of truth) at once encompasses all the worlds of the ten directions. All buddhas, gods and humans, and all types of living beings, fully achieve majestic existence through you. You must trust in this before understanding it.

172 From the Treatises of Sengzhao, “Nirvana has no name” (肇論·涅槃無名論) (節選)無名曰：夫至人空洞無象，而萬物無非我造。會萬物以成已者，其唯聖人乎！(CBETA X 1858, 45: 161a7)
173 A direct (but slightly altered) quote from the Shou lengyan jing 首楞嚴經 (Śūraṅgama-sūtra; T 945, 19:146b10–11).
174 A metaphor for the awakened mind, where there is no discrepancy between perception and reality, between large (the great earth) and the small (an inch of soil), destroying notions of conceptual distinctions.
侍郎臨終前一日，親寫一偈與家人。令來日送達李駙馬處。偈曰。

漚生與漚滅，二法本來齊。
欲識真歸處，趙州東院西。

侍舉肇論云。「『會萬物為己者，其唯聖人乎。』如今山河大地，樹木人物搆地，是同是別。若道同去，是他頭頭物物，各各不同。若道別去。他古人又道會萬物為己。且恁生會。秖如教中說。『若有一人發真歸源，十方虛空一時銷隕。』古德亦云。『若人識得心，大地無寸土。』此是甚道理。直下盡十方世界是汝一隻眼。一切諸佛，天人，群生類，盡承汝威光建立。須是信得乃方得。」

IV. Farewell

On the day prior to the end of his life, the Vice Director composed an intimate verse for the members of his family. The following day it was sent to the emperor’s son-in-law, Li [Zunxu]. The verse said:

Effervescent rising and effervescent perishing,
The two processes are essentially the same.
If we wish to know the true place to which we return,
It is to the west of Zhaozhou’s Eastern Cloister.

尉接得偈。云。「泰山廟裏賣紙錢。」

When the Commandant [Li Zunxi] received the verse, he said: “In the imperial temple on Mount Tai, they sell ritual paper currency [to be burned as offerings in sacrifices for the dead].”

尉接得偈。云。「泰山廟裏賣紙錢。」

175 Substituting the graphically similar 若 for 苦.
References

Abbreviations

CDL  Jingde Chuandeng lu 景徳傳燈錄
C-Text  Chinese Text Project 中國哲學書電子化計劃. 金瓶梅 https://ctext.org/lib
GDL  Tiansheng Guangdeng lu 天聖廣燈錄
Hucker  A Dictionary of Official Titles in Imperial China
QTW  Quan Tangwen 全唐文
SGSZ  Song gaoseng zhuan 宋高僧傳
SS  Song Shi 宋史
ZTJ  Zutang ji 祖堂集

Primary Sources (listed by title)


Zhejiang University Library.

\textit{Gaṇḍavyūha Sūtra}. See \textit{Huayan jing}.

\textit{Han shu} 漢書 (History of the Han Dynasty). Ban Gu 班固. Ed. Wuzhou tongwen lithograph, 1903.
https://ctext.org/library.pl?if=en&res=77689&by_collection=7

\textit{Huayan jing} 華嚴經 (\textit{Gaṇḍavyūha Sūtra}). Buddhhabhadra 佛陀跋陀羅. Trans. CBETA T 278, 9; see also CBETA T 279, 10.

\textit{Jianzhong jingguo xu denglu} 建中靖國續燈錄 (Jianzhong jingguo era Continued Lamp Record). Wei bo 惟白. Comp. CBETA X 1556, 78.

\textit{Jiatai pu denglu} 嘉泰普燈錄 (Jiatai era Comprehensive Lamp Record). Zhengshou 正受. Comp. CBETA X 1559, 79.


\textit{Lotus Sūtra}. See \textit{Miaofa lianhua jing}.

\textit{Luohu yelu} 羅湖野錄 (Records of a Rustic from Lake Luo). Xiaoying 曉瑩. CBETA X 1577, 83.


https://ctext.org/shan-hai-jing


https://ctext.org/shang-shu/zh


Tiansheng Guang denglu 天聖廣燈錄 (Tiansheng era Expanded Lamp Record). Li Zunxu 李遵朂. Comp. CBETA X 1553, 78.


Wudeng Huiyuan 五燈會元 (Compendium of the Five Lamps). Puji 普濟. Comp. CBETA X 1565, 80.


Xuansha shibei chanshi yulu 玄沙師備禪師語錄. Lin Hongyan 林弘衍. Ed. CBETA X 1446, 73.

Zhao lun 肇論 (Treatises of Sengzhao). Sengzhao 僧肇. CBETA T 1858, 45.


Secondary Sources


Cleary, Thomas. Trans. The Blue Cliff Record. BDK English Tripitaka 75 (Numata Center for Buddhist Translation and Research, 1998).


Literati Chan at the Song Dynasty Court


